

# Exhibit B

**EX. B to DeRubbio**  
*(Alphabetically by Last Name of 9/11 Decedent)*

	DECEDENT First Name	DECEDENT Middle Name	DECEDENT Last Name	Suffix Name	Economic Damage Amount	Non-Economic Damage Amount	TOTAL Damage Amount
1.	Dennis	L.	Devlin		\$2,127,428	\$2,000,000	\$4,127,428
2.	Luke		Dudek		\$797,841	\$2,000,000	\$2,797,841
3.	Sadie		Ette		\$1,023,792	\$2,000,000	\$3,023,792
4.	Thomas		Farino		\$6,454,069	\$2,000,000	\$8,454,069
5.	Francis	J.	Feely			\$2,000,000	\$2,000,000
6.	Sean	B.	Fegan		\$2,373,119	\$2,000,000	\$4,373,119
7.	Samuel		Fields	Sr.	\$2,434,137	\$2,000,000	\$4,434,137
8.	Stephen	M.	Fogel		\$4,900,633	\$2,000,000	\$6,900,633
9.	Donald	A.	Foreman			\$2,000,000	\$2,000,000
10.	Tamitha		Freeman		\$2,446,949	\$2,000,000	\$4,446,949
11.	Brett	O.	Freiman			\$2,000,000	\$2,000,000
12.	Julie	M.	Geis		\$4,529,827	\$2,000,000	\$6,529,827
13.	Edward	F.	Geraghty			\$2,000,000	\$2,000,000
14.	Lisa	F.	Gordenstein		\$8,160,941	\$2,000,000	\$10,160,941
15.	Jon	R.	Grabowski		\$8,073,992	\$2,000,000	\$10,073,992
16.	Gilbert		Granados			\$2,000,000	\$2,000,000
17.	Tara	McCloud	Gray		\$2,381,333	\$2,000,000	\$4,381,333
18.	Derrick	A.	Green		\$588,936	\$2,000,000	\$2,588,936
19.	John	M.	Griffin		\$5,674,787	\$2,000,000	\$7,674,787
20.	Nezam		Hafiz		\$2,099,060	\$2,000,000	\$4,099,060
21.	Carolyn		Halmon		\$1,202,347	\$2,000,000	\$3,202,347
22.	Mohammad	S.	Hamdani		\$3,066,133	\$2,000,000	\$5,066,133
23.	Roberta	B.	Heber		\$788,942	\$2,000,000	\$2,788,942
24.	Charles	J.	Houston		\$3,513,822	\$2,000,000	\$5,513,822
25.	Jennifer	L.	Howley		\$5,436,765	\$2,000,000	\$7,436,765
26.	Marian	R.	Hrycak		\$375,595	\$2,000,000	\$2,375,595
27.	Lamar	D.	Hulse		\$466,975	\$2,000,000	\$2,466,975
28.	Stephen	N.	Hyland			\$2,000,000	\$2,000,000
29.	Ernest		James		\$725,225	\$2,000,000	\$2,725,225
30.	Maxima		Jean-Pierre		\$575,888	\$2,000,000	\$2,575,888
31.	Alva	Cynthia	Jeffries-Sanchez		\$824,457	\$2,000,000	\$2,824,457
32.	Paul	W.	Jurgens			\$2,000,000	\$2,000,000

TOTALS

\$71,042,993

\$64,000,000

**\$135,042,993**

# **Exhibit B-1**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mrs. Tara McCloud-Gray**

December 13, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **March 25, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile



VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	4.2%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MRS. TARA MCCLOUD-GRAY**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$2,245,522
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	135,811
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$2,381,333</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
54,367	3.0%	16.100%	2,456	18.260%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MRS. TARA MCCLLOUD-GRAY**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	31	0.31	1.00000	\$16,671	\$753	\$0	(\$2,684)	(\$1,731)	\$13,009	\$13,009
2002	32	1.31	1.06997	58,171	2,627	(1,530)	(9,085)	(5,857)	44,326	44,326
2003	33	2.31	1.06794	62,123	2,806	(1,634)	(9,702)	(6,255)	47,338	47,338
2004	34	3.31	1.06591	66,217	2,991	(1,742)	(10,341)	(6,667)	50,458	50,458
2005	35	4.31	1.06388	70,447	3,182	(1,853)	(11,002)	(7,093)	53,681	53,681
2006	36	5.31	1.06185	74,804	3,379	(1,968)	(11,682)	(7,532)	57,001	57,001
2007	37	6.31	1.05983	79,280	3,581	(2,086)	(12,381)	(7,983)	60,411	60,411
2008	38	7.31	1.05781	83,863	3,788	(2,206)	(13,097)	(12,463)	59,886	59,886
2009	39	8.31	1.05580	88,543	3,999	(2,329)	(13,828)	(13,158)	63,227	63,227
2010	40	9.31	1.05379	93,306	4,214	(2,455)	(14,572)	(13,866)	66,629	66,629
2011	41	10.31	1.05179	98,138	4,433	(2,582)	(15,326)	(14,584)	70,079	70,079
2012	42	11.31	1.04979	103,024	4,653	(2,710)	(16,089)	(15,310)	73,568	73,568
2013	43	12.31	1.04779	107,947	4,876	(2,840)	(16,858)	(16,042)	77,084	77,084
2014	44	13.31	1.04579	112,891	5,099	(2,970)	(17,630)	(16,776)	80,614	80,614
2015	45	14.31	1.04380	117,836	5,322	(3,100)	(18,402)	(17,511)	84,145	84,145
2016	46	15.31	1.04182	122,763	5,545	(3,230)	(19,172)	(18,243)	87,664	87,664
2017	47	16.31	1.03984	127,654	5,766	(3,358)	(19,936)	(18,970)	91,156	91,156
2018	48	17.31	1.03786	132,486	5,984	(3,485)	(20,690)	(19,688)	94,606	94,606
2019	49	18.31	1.03588	137,240	6,199	(3,610)	(21,433)	(20,395)	98,001	98,001
2020	50	19.31	1.03391	141,894	6,409	(3,733)	(22,160)	(21,086)	101,324	99,098
2021	51	20.31	1.03194	146,426	6,614	(3,852)	(22,867)	(21,760)	104,561	98,142
2022	52	21.31	1.03000	150,819	6,812	(3,968)	(23,553)	(22,413)	107,698	97,012
2023	53	22.31	1.03000	155,344	7,017	(4,087)	(24,260)	(23,085)	110,929	95,894
2024	54	23.31	1.03000	160,004	7,227	(4,209)	(24,988)	(23,777)	114,257	94,790
2025	55	24.31	1.03000	164,804	7,444	(4,335)	(25,737)	(24,491)	117,684	93,698
2026	56	25.31	1.03000	169,748	7,667	(4,466)	(26,510)	(25,225)	121,215	92,619
2027	57	26.31	1.03000	174,841	7,897	(4,600)	(27,305)	(25,982)	124,851	91,553
2028	58	27.31	1.03000	180,086	8,134	(4,737)	(28,124)	(26,762)	128,597	90,498
2029	59	28.31	1.03000	185,488	8,378	(4,880)	(28,968)	(27,565)	132,455	89,456
2030	60	28.64	1.03000	63,685	2,877	(1,675)	(9,946)	(9,464)	45,476	29,881
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$3,446,542</b>	<b>\$155,674</b>	<b>(\$90,229)</b>	<b>(\$538,327)</b>	<b>(\$491,733)</b>	<b>\$2,481,927</b>	<b>\$2,245,522</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	18.260%	4.000%	1.441%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MRS. TARA MCCLLOUD-GRAY**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401(k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	31	0.31	\$667	\$233	\$0	(\$111)	\$789	\$789
2002	32	1.31	2,327	813	0	(388)	2,751	2,751
2003	33	2.31	2,410	868	0	(406)	2,873	2,873
2004	34	3.31	2,569	926	0	(432)	3,062	3,062
2005	35	4.31	2,733	985	0	(460)	3,258	3,258
2006	36	5.31	2,902	1,046	0	(488)	3,460	3,460
2007	37	6.31	3,076	1,108	0	(518)	3,667	3,667
2008	38	7.31	3,254	1,172	0	(808)	3,618	3,618
2009	39	8.31	3,435	1,238	0	(853)	3,820	3,820
2010	40	9.31	3,620	1,304	0	(899)	4,025	4,025
2011	41	10.31	3,808	1,372	0	(946)	4,234	4,234
2012	42	11.31	3,997	1,440	0	(993)	4,445	4,445
2013	43	12.31	4,188	1,509	0	(1,040)	4,657	4,657
2014	44	13.31	4,380	1,578	0	(1,088)	4,870	4,870
2015	45	14.31	4,572	1,647	0	(1,136)	5,083	5,083
2016	46	15.31	4,763	1,716	0	(1,183)	5,296	5,296
2017	47	16.31	4,953	1,784	0	(1,230)	5,507	5,507
2018	48	17.31	5,140	1,852	0	(1,277)	5,716	5,716
2019	49	18.31	5,325	1,918	0	(1,323)	5,921	5,921
2020	50	19.31	5,505	1,983	0	(1,367)	6,121	5,987
2021	51	20.31	5,681	2,047	0	(1,411)	6,317	5,929
2022	52	21.31	5,852	2,108	0	(1,453)	6,506	5,861
2023	53	22.31	6,027	2,171	0	(1,497)	6,702	5,793
2024	54	23.31	6,208	2,236	0	(1,542)	6,903	5,727
2025	55	24.31	6,394	2,304	0	(1,588)	7,110	5,661
2026	56	25.31	6,586	2,373	0	(1,636)	7,323	5,595
2027	57	26.31	6,784	2,444	0	(1,685)	7,543	5,531
2028	58	27.31	6,987	2,517	0	(1,736)	7,769	5,467
2029	59	28.31	7,197	2,593	0	(1,788)	8,002	5,404
2030	60	28.64	2,471	890	0	(614)	2,747	1,805
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$133,816</b>	<b>\$48,175</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$31,897)</b>	<b>\$150,093</b>	<b>\$135,811</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MRS. TARA MCCLOUD-GRAY**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	31	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	32	1.31			0	0
2003	33	2.31			0	0
2004	34	3.31			0	0
2005	35	4.31			0	0
2006	36	5.31			0	0
2007	37	6.31			0	0
2008	38	7.31			0	0
2009	39	8.31			0	0
2010	40	9.31			0	0
2011	41	10.31			0	0
2012	42	11.31			0	0
2013	43	12.31			0	0
2014	44	13.31			0	0
2015	45	14.31			0	0
2016	46	15.31			0	0
2017	47	16.31			0	0
2018	48	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-2**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Marian Hrycak**

December 12, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **May 29, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.4%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES  
MARIAN HRYCAK**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$284,392
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	91,203
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$375,595</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
41,991	3.0%	14.720%	2,400	22.779%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MARIAN HRYCAK**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	56	0.31	1.00000	\$12,876	\$736	\$0	(\$1,895)	(\$2,501)	\$9,215	\$9,215
2002	57	1.31	1.03000	43,250	2,472	(1,170)	(6,175)	(8,150)	30,228	30,228
2003	58	2.31	1.03000	44,548	2,546	(1,205)	(6,361)	(8,394)	31,134	31,134
2004	59	3.31	1.03000	45,884	2,623	(1,241)	(6,552)	(8,646)	32,069	32,069
2005	60	4.31	1.03000	47,261	2,701	(1,278)	(6,748)	(8,905)	33,031	33,031
2006	61	5.31	1.03000	48,679	2,782	(1,317)	(6,951)	(9,173)	34,022	34,022
2007	62	6.31	1.03000	50,139	2,866	(1,356)	(7,159)	(9,448)	35,042	35,042
2008	63	7.31	1.03000	51,643	2,952	(1,397)	(7,374)	(9,731)	36,093	36,093
2009	64	8.31	1.03000	53,192	3,041	(1,439)	(7,595)	(10,023)	37,176	37,176
2010	65	8.47	1.03000	9,131	522	(247)	(1,304)	(1,721)	6,382	6,382
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$406,604</b>	<b>\$23,242</b>	<b>(\$10,649)</b>	<b>(\$58,113)</b>	<b>(\$76,691)</b>	<b>\$284,392</b>	<b>\$284,392</b>



Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	14.720%	22.779%	4.000%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MARIAN HRYCAK**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PROJECTED PENSION	VESTED PENSION	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	56	0.31	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
2002	57	1.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2003	58	2.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2004	59	3.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2005	60	4.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2006	61	5.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2007	62	6.31	0	(13,362)	1,967	2,596	(8,799)	(8,799)
2008	63	7.31	0	(16,034)	2,360	3,115	(10,559)	(10,559)
2009	64	8.31	0	(16,034)	2,360	3,115	(10,559)	(10,559)
2010	65	9.31	23,894	(16,034)	(1,157)	(1,527)	5,176	5,176
2011	66	10.31	28,673	(16,034)	(1,860)	(2,455)	8,323	8,323
2012	67	11.31	28,673	(16,194)	(1,837)	(2,424)	8,218	8,218
2013	68	12.31	28,673	(16,356)	(1,813)	(2,393)	8,111	8,111
2014	69	13.31	28,673	(16,520)	(1,789)	(2,361)	8,003	8,003
2015	70	14.31	28,853	(16,685)	(1,791)	(2,364)	8,013	8,013
2016	71	15.31	29,033	(16,852)	(1,793)	(2,366)	8,022	8,022
2017	72	16.31	29,213	(17,021)	(1,795)	(2,368)	8,029	8,029
2018	73	17.31	29,393	(17,191)	(1,796)	(2,370)	8,036	8,036
2019	74	18.31	29,573	(17,363)	(1,797)	(2,372)	8,041	8,041
2020	75	19.31	29,753	(17,537)	(1,798)	(2,373)	8,045	7,901
2021	76	20.31	29,933	(17,712)	(1,799)	(2,374)	8,048	7,644
2022	77	21.31	30,113	(17,889)	(1,799)	(2,375)	8,050	7,395
2023	78	22.31	30,293	(18,068)	(1,800)	(2,375)	8,051	7,152
2024	79	23.31	30,473	(18,248)	(1,800)	(2,375)	8,051	6,917
2025	80	24.23	28,099	(16,892)	(1,650)	(2,177)	7,380	6,140
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$463,315</b>	<b>(\$318,026)</b>	<b>(\$21,387)</b>	<b>(\$28,224)</b>	<b>\$95,679</b>	<b>\$91,203</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MARIAN HRYCAK**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	56	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	57	1.31			0	0
2003	58	2.31			0	0
2004	59	3.31			0	0
2005	60	4.31			0	0
2006	61	5.31			0	0
2007	62	6.31			0	0
2008	63	7.31			0	0
2009	64	8.31			0	0
2010	65	9.31			0	0
2011	66	10.31			0	0
2012	67	11.31			0	0
2013	68	12.31			0	0
2014	69	13.31			0	0
2015	70	14.31			0	0
2016	71	15.31			0	0
2017	72	16.31			0	0
2018	73	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-3**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Sean Bernard Fegan**

December 10, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **March 6, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	4.2%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES  
MR. SEAN BERNARD FEGAN**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$2,084,043
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	289,076
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$2,373,119</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
102,182	3.0%	21.600%	3,023	48.040%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. SEAN BERNARD FEGAN**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	34	0.31	1.00000	\$31,333	\$927	\$0	(\$6,768)	(\$11,801)	\$13,691	\$13,691
2002	35	1.31	1.06388	108,709	3,216	(2,632)	(22,777)	(40,943)	45,572	45,572
2003	36	2.31	1.06185	115,433	3,415	(2,795)	(24,185)	(42,172)	49,695	49,695
2004	37	3.31	1.05983	122,339	3,619	(2,963)	(25,632)	(44,695)	52,669	52,669
2005	38	4.31	1.05781	129,412	3,829	(3,134)	(27,114)	(47,279)	55,714	55,714
2006	39	5.31	1.05580	136,634	4,042	(3,309)	(28,627)	(49,917)	58,823	58,823
2007	40	6.31	1.05379	143,983	4,260	(3,487)	(30,167)	(52,602)	61,987	61,987
2008	41	7.31	1.05179	151,440	4,480	(3,667)	(31,730)	(55,326)	65,197	65,197
2009	42	8.31	1.04979	158,980	4,703	(3,850)	(33,309)	(58,081)	68,443	68,443
2010	43	9.31	1.04779	166,577	4,928	(4,034)	(34,901)	(60,856)	71,714	71,714
2011	44	10.31	1.04579	174,205	5,154	(4,219)	(36,499)	(63,643)	74,998	74,998
2012	45	11.31	1.04380	181,836	5,380	(4,403)	(38,098)	(66,431)	78,283	78,283
2013	46	12.31	1.04182	189,440	5,605	(4,587)	(39,691)	(69,209)	81,557	81,557
2014	47	13.31	1.03984	196,986	5,828	(4,770)	(41,273)	(71,966)	84,806	84,806
2015	48	14.31	1.03786	204,444	6,049	(4,951)	(42,835)	(74,690)	88,016	88,016
2016	49	15.31	1.03588	211,779	6,266	(5,128)	(44,372)	(77,370)	91,174	91,174
2017	50	16.31	1.03391	218,961	6,478	(5,302)	(45,877)	(79,994)	94,266	94,266
2018	51	17.31	1.03194	225,955	6,685	(5,472)	(47,342)	(82,549)	97,277	97,277
2019	52	18.31	1.03000	232,734	6,886	(5,636)	(48,762)	(85,026)	100,195	100,195
2020	53	19.31	1.03000	239,716	7,092	(5,805)	(50,225)	(87,576)	103,201	100,934
2021	54	20.31	1.03000	246,907	7,305	(5,979)	(51,732)	(90,204)	106,297	99,771
2022	55	21.31	1.03000	254,314	7,524	(6,158)	(53,284)	(92,910)	109,486	98,622
2023	56	22.31	1.03000	261,944	7,750	(6,343)	(54,882)	(95,697)	112,771	97,487
2024	57	23.31	1.03000	269,802	7,982	(6,533)	(56,529)	(98,568)	116,154	96,364
2025	58	24.31	1.03000	277,896	8,222	(6,729)	(58,225)	(101,525)	119,638	95,254
2026	59	25.31	1.03000	286,233	8,468	(6,931)	(59,972)	(104,571)	123,228	94,157
2027	60	26.03	1.03000	212,203	6,278	(5,139)	(44,461)	(77,525)	91,356	67,376
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$5,150,193</b>	<b>\$152,371</b>	<b>(\$123,958)</b>	<b>(\$1,079,271)</b>	<b>(\$1,883,126)</b>	<b>\$2,216,209</b>	<b>\$2,084,043</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	48.040%	7.840%	4.000%

## EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS

MR. SEAN BERNARD FEGAN

SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401(k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	34	0.31	\$2,457	\$1,253	\$0	(\$1,782)	\$1,928	\$1,928
2002	35	1.31	8,267	4,218	0	(5,998)	6,487	6,487
2003	36	2.31	8,778	4,479	0	(6,369)	6,888	6,888
2004	37	3.31	9,304	4,747	0	(6,750)	7,301	7,301
2005	38	4.31	9,842	5,021	0	(7,140)	7,723	7,723
2006	39	5.31	10,391	5,301	0	(7,538)	8,154	8,154
2007	40	6.31	10,950	5,587	0	(7,944)	8,592	8,592
2008	41	7.31	11,517	5,876	0	(8,355)	9,037	9,037
2009	42	8.31	12,090	6,168	0	(8,771)	9,487	9,487
2010	43	9.31	12,668	6,463	0	(9,191)	9,940	9,940
2011	44	10.31	13,248	6,759	0	(9,611)	10,396	10,396
2012	45	11.31	13,828	7,055	0	(10,032)	10,851	10,851
2013	46	12.31	14,407	7,350	0	(10,452)	11,305	11,305
2014	47	13.31	14,980	7,643	0	(10,868)	11,755	11,755
2015	48	14.31	15,548	7,932	0	(11,280)	12,200	12,200
2016	49	15.31	16,105	8,217	0	(11,684)	12,638	12,638
2017	50	16.31	16,652	8,496	0	(12,081)	13,066	13,066
2018	51	17.31	17,183	8,767	0	(12,467)	13,484	13,484
2019	52	18.31	17,699	9,030	0	(12,841)	13,888	13,888
2020	53	19.31	18,230	9,301	0	(13,226)	14,305	13,991
2021	54	20.31	18,777	9,580	0	(13,623)	14,734	13,830
2022	55	21.31	19,340	9,867	0	(14,031)	15,176	13,670
2023	56	22.31	19,920	10,163	0	(14,452)	15,631	13,513
2024	57	23.31	20,518	10,468	0	(14,886)	16,100	13,357
2025	58	24.31	21,133	10,782	0	(15,332)	16,583	13,203
2026	59	25.31	21,767	11,106	0	(15,792)	17,081	13,051
2027	60	26.03	16,138	8,233	0	(11,708)	12,663	9,339
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$391,736</b>	<b>\$199,865</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$284,205)</b>	<b>\$307,396</b>	<b>\$289,076</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MR. SEAN BERNARD FEGAN**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	34	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	35	1.31			0	0
2003	36	2.31			0	0
2004	37	3.31			0	0
2005	38	4.31			0	0
2006	39	5.31			0	0
2007	40	6.31			0	0
2008	41	7.31			0	0
2009	42	8.31			0	0
2010	43	9.31			0	0
2011	44	10.31			0	0
2012	45	11.31			0	0
2013	46	12.31			0	0
2014	47	13.31			0	0
2015	48	14.31			0	0
2016	49	15.31			0	0
2017	50	16.31			0	0
2018	51	17.31			0	0
2019	52	18.31			0	0
2020	53	19.31			0	0
2021	54	20.31			0	0
2022	55	21.31			0	0
2023	56	22.31			0	0
2024	57	23.31			0	0
2025	58	24.31			0	0
2026	59	25.31			0	0
2027	60	26.31			0	0
2028	61	27.31			0	0
2029	62	28.31			0	0
2030	63	29.31			0	0
2031	64	30.31			0	0
2032	65	31.31			0	0
2033	66	32.31			0	0
2034	67	33.31			0	0
2035	68	34.31			0	0
2036	69	35.31			0	0
2037	70	36.31			0	0
2038	71	37.31			0	0
2039	72	38.31			0	0
2040	73	39.31			0	0
2041	74	40.31			0	0
2042	75	40.72			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>



# **Exhibit B-4**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Sadie Ette**

January 2, 2020

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **June 8, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,



John E. Beauzile

<b>Valuation Date</b>	01-Jan-20
<b>Discount Rate</b>	3.9%

**Exhibit 1. Summary of Economic Damages**  
**Sadie Ette**

	<u><b>Present Value</b></u>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$986,548
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	37,243
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	<u>0</u>
<b>Total</b>	<u><b>\$1,023,792</b></u>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
29,510	3.0%	10.460%	3,030	14.83-73.55%

**Exhibit 2a. Present Value of Lost Earnings**  
**Sadie Ette**  
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Age-Specific Growth Factor	Earnings	Benefits	Unempl. Adj.	Taxes	Consumption	Net Earnings	PV of Net Earnings
2001	36	0.31	1.00000	\$9,049	\$929	\$0	(\$947)	(\$1,201)	\$7,830	\$7,830
2002	37	1.31	1.05983	31,276	3,211	(926)	(3,173)	(4,027)	26,360	26,360
2003	38	2.31	1.05781	33,084	3,397	(980)	(3,357)	(4,260)	27,884	27,884
2004	39	3.31	1.05580	34,930	3,586	(1,035)	(3,544)	(4,498)	29,439	29,439
2005	40	4.31	1.05379	36,809	3,779	(1,090)	(3,735)	(4,740)	31,023	31,023
2006	41	5.31	1.05179	38,715	3,975	(1,147)	(3,928)	(4,985)	32,630	32,630
2007	42	6.31	1.04979	40,643	4,173	(1,204)	(4,124)	(5,234)	34,254	34,254
2008	43	7.31	1.04779	42,585	4,372	(1,261)	(4,321)	(5,484)	35,891	35,891
2009	44	8.31	1.04579	44,535	4,572	(1,319)	(4,519)	(5,735)	37,535	37,535
2010	45	9.31	1.04380	46,486	4,772	(1,377)	(4,717)	(5,986)	39,179	39,179
2011	46	10.31	1.04182	48,430	4,972	(1,434)	(4,914)	(6,236)	40,817	40,817
2012	47	11.31	1.03984	50,359	5,170	(1,492)	(5,110)	(6,485)	42,443	42,443
2013	48	12.31	1.03786	52,266	5,366	(1,548)	(5,303)	(6,730)	44,050	44,050
2014	49	13.31	1.03588	54,141	5,558	(1,604)	(5,493)	(6,972)	45,631	45,631
2015	50	14.31	1.03391	55,977	5,747	(1,658)	(5,680)	(7,208)	47,178	47,178
2016	51	15.31	1.03194	57,765	5,930	(1,711)	(5,861)	(7,438)	48,685	48,685
2017	52	16.31	1.03000	59,498	6,108	(1,762)	(6,037)	(7,662)	50,146	50,146
2018	53	17.31	1.03000	61,283	6,292	(1,815)	(6,218)	(7,891)	51,650	51,650
2019	54	18.31	1.03000	63,121	6,480	(1,870)	(6,404)	(11,823)	49,505	49,505
2020	55	19.31	1.03000	65,015	6,675	(1,926)	(6,597)	(12,178)	50,990	49,947
2021	56	20.31	1.03000	66,966	6,875	(1,984)	(6,794)	(12,543)	52,520	49,514
2022	57	21.31	1.03000	68,974	7,081	(2,043)	(6,998)	(44,059)	22,955	20,829
2023	58	22.31	1.03000	71,044	7,294	(2,104)	(7,208)	(45,381)	23,644	20,649
2024	59	23.31	1.03000	73,175	7,512	(2,167)	(7,424)	(46,743)	24,353	20,470
2025	60	24.31	1.03000	75,370	7,738	(2,232)	(7,647)	(48,145)	25,083	20,293
2026	61	25.31	1.03000	77,631	7,970	(2,299)	(7,877)	(49,589)	25,836	20,117
2027	62	26.31	1.03000	79,960	8,209	(2,368)	(8,113)	(51,077)	26,611	19,943
2028	63	27.31	1.03000	82,359	8,455	(2,439)	(8,356)	(52,609)	27,409	19,770
2029	64	28.31	1.03000	84,830	8,709	(2,513)	(8,607)	(54,187)	28,232	19,599
2030	65	28.47	1.03000	14,562	1,495	(431)	(1,478)	(9,302)	4,846	3,290
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$1,620,840</b>	<b>\$166,401</b>	<b>(\$47,741)</b>	<b>(\$164,482)</b>	<b>(\$540,410)</b>	<b>\$1,034,608</b>	<b>\$986,548</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	10.460%	14.83-73.55%	4.000%	0.000%

## Exhibit 3a. Present Value of Lost Pension Benefits

Sadie Ette

Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Pension Contrib.	401(k)	Taxes	Consumption	Net Loss	PV of Net Loss
2001	36	0.31	\$362	\$0	\$0	(\$54)	\$308	\$308
2002	37	1.31	1,214	0	0	(180)	1,034	1,034
2003	38	2.31	1,284	0	0	(190)	1,093	1,093
2004	39	3.31	1,355	0	0	(201)	1,154	1,154
2005	40	4.31	1,428	0	0	(212)	1,216	1,216
2006	41	5.31	1,502	0	0	(223)	1,279	1,279
2007	42	6.31	1,577	0	0	(234)	1,343	1,343
2008	43	7.31	1,652	0	0	(245)	1,407	1,407
2009	44	8.31	1,728	0	0	(256)	1,472	1,472
2010	45	9.31	1,804	0	0	(267)	1,536	1,536
2011	46	10.31	1,879	0	0	(279)	1,600	1,600
2012	47	11.31	1,954	0	0	(290)	1,664	1,664
2013	48	12.31	2,028	0	0	(301)	1,727	1,727
2014	49	13.31	2,101	0	0	(311)	1,789	1,789
2015	50	14.31	2,172	0	0	(322)	1,850	1,850
2016	51	15.31	2,241	0	0	(332)	1,909	1,909
2017	52	16.31	2,309	0	0	(342)	1,966	1,966
2018	53	17.31	2,378	0	0	(353)	2,025	2,025
2019	54	18.31	2,449	0	0	(528)	1,921	1,921
2020	55	19.31	2,523	0	0	(544)	1,979	1,938
2021	56	20.31	2,598	0	0	(560)	2,038	1,921
2022	57	21.31	2,676	0	0	(1,968)	708	642
2023	58	22.31	2,756	0	0	(2,027)	729	637
2024	59	23.31	2,839	0	0	(2,088)	751	631
2025	60	24.31	2,924	0	0	(2,151)	774	626
2026	61	25.31	3,012	0	0	(2,215)	797	620
2027	62	26.31	3,102	0	0	(2,282)	821	615
2028	63	27.31	3,196	0	0	(2,350)	845	610
2029	64	28.31	3,291	0	0	(2,421)	871	604
2030	65	28.47	565	0	0	(416)	149	101
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$62,899</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$24,142)</b>	<b>\$38,758</b>	<b>\$37,243</b>

**Exhibit 4a. Loss Estimated Value of Replacement Services**  
**Sadie Ette**

<b>Year</b>	<b>Age</b>	<b>Time Frame</b>	<b>Household Services</b>	<b>Care Services</b>	<b>Total Services</b>	<b>Present Value</b>
2001	36	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	37	1.31			0	0
2003	38	2.31			0	0
2004	39	3.31			0	0
2005	40	4.31			0	0
2006	41	5.31			0	0
2007	42	6.31			0	0
2008	43	7.31			0	0
2009	44	8.31			0	0
2010	45	9.31			0	0
2011	46	10.31			0	0
2012	47	11.31			0	0
2013	48	12.31			0	0
2014	49	13.31			0	0
2015	50	14.31			0	0
2016	51	15.31			0	0
2017	52	16.31			0	0
2018	53	17.31			0	0
2019	54	18.31			0	0
2020	55	19.31			0	0
2021	56	20.31			0	0
2022	57	21.31			0	0
2023	58	22.31			0	0
2024	59	23.31			0	0
2025	60	24.31			0	0
2026	61	25.31			0	0
2027	62	26.31			0	0
2028	63	27.31			0	0
2029	64	28.31			0	0
2030	65	29.31			0	0
2031	66	30.31			0	0
2032	67	31.31			0	0
2033	68	32.31			0	0
2034	69	33.31			0	0
2035	70	34.31			0	0
2036	71	35.06			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-5**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Derrick A. Green**

December 11, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **April 15, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile



<b>Valuation Date</b>	01-Jan-20
<b>Discount Rate</b>	3.9%

**Exhibit 1. Summary of Economic Damages  
Derrick A. Green**

	<b>Present Value</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$565,401
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	23,535
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$588,936</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
31,323	3.0%	12.250%	2,436	16.944%

**Exhibit 2a. Present Value of Lost Earnings**  
**Derrick A. Green**  
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Age-Specific Growth Factor	Earnings	Benefits	Unempl. Adj.	Taxes	Consumption	Net Earnings	PV of Net Earnings
2001	45	0.31	1.00000	\$9,605	\$747	\$0	(\$1,177)	(\$1,428)	\$7,747	\$7,747
2002	46	1.31	1.04182	32,633	2,538	(926)	(3,878)	(4,707)	25,661	25,661
2003	47	2.31	1.03984	33,933	2,639	(963)	(4,032)	(4,894)	26,683	26,683
2004	48	3.31	1.03786	35,218	2,739	(999)	(4,185)	(5,079)	27,693	27,693
2005	49	4.31	1.03588	36,481	2,837	(1,035)	(4,335)	(5,262)	28,687	28,687
2006	50	5.31	1.03391	37,719	2,933	(1,070)	(4,482)	(5,440)	29,660	29,660
2007	51	6.31	1.03194	38,923	3,027	(1,104)	(4,625)	(5,614)	30,607	30,607
2008	52	7.31	1.03000	40,091	3,118	(1,137)	(4,764)	(5,782)	31,526	31,526
2009	53	8.31	1.03000	41,294	3,212	(1,172)	(4,907)	(5,956)	32,471	32,471
2010	54	9.31	1.03000	42,533	3,308	(1,207)	(5,054)	(6,134)	33,445	33,445
2011	55	10.31	1.03000	43,809	3,407	(1,243)	(5,206)	(6,318)	34,449	34,449
2012	56	11.31	1.03000	45,123	3,509	(1,280)	(5,362)	(6,508)	35,482	35,482
2013	57	12.31	1.03000	46,477	3,615	(1,319)	(5,523)	(6,703)	36,547	36,547
2014	58	13.31	1.03000	47,871	3,723	(1,358)	(5,688)	(6,904)	37,643	37,643
2015	59	14.31	1.03000	49,307	3,835	(1,399)	(5,859)	(7,111)	38,772	38,772
2016	60	15.31	1.03000	50,786	3,950	(1,441)	(6,035)	(7,325)	39,936	39,936
2017	61	16.31	1.03000	52,310	4,068	(1,484)	(6,216)	(11,877)	36,801	36,801
2018	62	17.14	1.03000	44,901	3,492	(1,274)	(5,335)	(10,195)	31,589	31,589
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$729,013</b>	<b>\$56,697</b>	<b>(\$20,411)</b>	<b>(\$86,660)</b>	<b>(\$113,237)</b>	<b>\$565,401</b>	<b>\$565,401</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	16.944%	4.000%	0.000%

**Exhibit 3a. Present Value of Lost Pension Benefits****Derrick A. Green**

Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Pension	401(k)	Taxes	Consumption	Net Loss	PV of Net Loss
2001	45	0.31	\$384	\$0	\$0	(\$65)	\$319	\$319
2002	46	1.31	1,305	0	0	(221)	1,084	1,084
2003	47	2.31	1,317	0	0	(223)	1,094	1,094
2004	48	3.31	1,366	0	0	(232)	1,135	1,135
2005	49	4.31	1,415	0	0	(240)	1,176	1,176
2006	50	5.31	1,463	0	0	(248)	1,216	1,216
2007	51	6.31	1,510	0	0	(256)	1,254	1,254
2008	52	7.31	1,556	0	0	(264)	1,292	1,292
2009	53	8.31	1,602	0	0	(271)	1,331	1,331
2010	54	9.31	1,650	0	0	(280)	1,371	1,371
2011	55	10.31	1,700	0	0	(288)	1,412	1,412
2012	56	11.31	1,751	0	0	(297)	1,454	1,454
2013	57	12.31	1,803	0	0	(306)	1,498	1,498
2014	58	13.31	1,857	0	0	(315)	1,543	1,543
2015	59	14.31	1,913	0	0	(324)	1,589	1,589
2016	60	15.31	1,971	0	0	(334)	1,637	1,637
2017	61	16.31	2,030	0	0	(344)	1,686	1,686
2018	62	17.14	1,742	0	0	(295)	1,447	1,447
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$28,336</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$4,801)</b>	<b>\$23,535</b>	<b>\$23,535</b>

**Exhibit 4a. Loss Estimated Value of Replacement Services  
Derrick A. Green**

<b>Year</b>	<b>Age</b>	<b>Time Frame</b>	<b>Household Services</b>	<b>Care Services</b>	<b>Total Services</b>	<b>Present Value</b>
2001	45	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	46	1.31			0	0
2003	47	2.31			0	0
2004	48	3.31			0	0
2005	49	4.31			0	0
2006	50	5.31			0	0
2007	51	6.31			0	0
2008	52	7.31			0	0
2009	53	8.31			0	0
2010	54	9.31			0	0
2011	55	10.31			0	0
2012	56	11.31			0	0
2013	57	12.31			0	0
2014	58	13.31			0	0
2015	59	14.31			0	0
2016	60	15.31			0	0
2017	61	16.31			0	0
2018	62	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-6**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mrs. Jennifer Howley**

December 11, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **May 8, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	4.2%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES  
MRS. JENNIFER HOWLEY**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$4,805,567
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	631,198
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$5,436,765</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
157,312	3.0%	26.350%	2,452	12.487%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MRS. JENNIFER HOWLEY**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	34	0.31	1.00000	\$48,238	\$752	\$0	(\$12,711)	(\$4,436)	\$31,843	\$31,843
2002	35	1.31	1.06388	167,360	2,609	(3,755)	(42,776)	(14,929)	108,508	108,508
2003	36	2.31	1.06185	177,712	2,770	(3,988)	(45,422)	(15,853)	115,219	115,219
2004	37	3.31	1.05983	188,344	2,936	(4,226)	(48,140)	(16,801)	122,113	122,113
2005	38	4.31	1.05781	199,233	3,106	(4,471)	(50,923)	(17,772)	129,173	129,173
2006	39	5.31	1.05580	210,351	3,279	(4,720)	(53,765)	(18,764)	136,381	136,381
2007	40	6.31	1.05379	221,666	3,456	(4,974)	(56,657)	(19,774)	143,718	143,718
2008	41	7.31	1.05179	233,146	3,635	(5,232)	(59,591)	(20,798)	151,160	151,160
2009	42	8.31	1.04979	244,753	3,816	(5,492)	(62,558)	(21,833)	158,686	158,686
2010	43	9.31	1.04779	256,450	3,998	(5,755)	(65,547)	(22,876)	166,269	166,269
2011	44	10.31	1.04579	268,193	4,181	(6,018)	(68,549)	(23,924)	173,883	173,883
2012	45	11.31	1.04380	279,941	4,364	(6,282)	(71,552)	(24,972)	181,500	181,500
2013	46	12.31	1.04182	291,648	4,547	(6,544)	(74,544)	(26,016)	189,090	189,090
2014	47	13.31	1.03984	303,266	4,728	(6,805)	(77,513)	(27,053)	196,623	196,623
2015	48	14.31	1.03786	314,746	4,907	(7,063)	(80,448)	(28,077)	204,066	204,066
2016	49	15.31	1.03588	326,040	5,083	(7,316)	(83,334)	(29,084)	211,388	211,388
2017	50	16.31	1.03391	337,096	5,255	(7,564)	(86,160)	(30,070)	218,556	218,556
2018	51	17.31	1.03194	347,864	5,423	(7,806)	(88,912)	(31,031)	225,538	225,538
2019	52	18.31	1.03000	358,300	5,586	(8,040)	(91,580)	(31,962)	232,304	232,304
2020	53	19.31	1.03000	369,049	5,753	(8,281)	(94,327)	(32,921)	239,273	239,273
2021	54	20.31	1.03000	380,120	5,926	(8,530)	(97,157)	(33,908)	246,451	246,451
2022	55	21.31	1.03000	391,524	6,104	(8,786)	(100,072)	(34,926)	253,845	253,845
2023	56	22.31	1.03000	403,269	6,287	(9,049)	(103,074)	(35,973)	261,460	261,460
2024	57	23.31	1.03000	415,368	6,475	(9,321)	(106,166)	(37,053)	269,304	269,304
2025	58	24.31	1.03000	427,829	6,670	(9,600)	(109,351)	(38,164)	277,383	277,383
2026	59	25.31	1.03000	440,663	6,870	(9,888)	(112,631)	(39,309)	285,704	285,704
2027	60	25.89	1.03000	264,765	4,128	(5,941)	(67,673)	(23,618)	171,661	171,661
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$7,866,935</b>	<b>\$122,641</b>	<b>(\$175,447)</b>	<b>(\$2,011,131)</b>	<b>(\$701,897)</b>	<b>\$5,101,101</b>	<b>\$4,805,567</b>



Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	26.350%	12.487%	0.000%	2.210%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MRS. JENNIFER HOWLEY**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PROJECTED PENSION	401 (K)	VESTED PENSION	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	34	0.31	\$0	\$785	\$0	\$0	(\$98)	\$687	\$687
2002	35	1.31	0	2,723	0	0	(340)	2,383	2,383
2003	36	2.31	0	2,805	0	0	(350)	2,455	2,455
2004	37	3.31	0	2,973	0	0	(371)	2,602	2,602
2005	38	4.31	0	3,145	0	0	(393)	2,752	2,752
2006	39	5.31	0	3,320	0	0	(415)	2,906	2,906
2007	40	6.31	0	3,499	0	0	(437)	3,062	3,062
2008	41	7.31	0	3,680	0	0	(460)	3,221	3,221
2009	42	8.31	0	3,863	0	0	(482)	3,381	3,381
2010	43	9.31	0	4,048	0	0	(505)	3,543	3,543
2011	44	10.31	0	4,233	0	0	(529)	3,705	3,705
2012	45	11.31	0	4,419	0	0	(552)	3,867	3,867
2013	46	12.31	0	4,604	0	0	(575)	4,029	4,029
2014	47	13.31	0	4,787	0	0	(598)	4,189	4,189
2015	48	14.31	0	4,968	0	0	(620)	4,348	4,348
2016	49	15.31	0	5,146	0	0	(643)	4,504	4,504
2017	50	16.31	0	5,321	0	0	(664)	4,657	4,657
2018	51	17.31	0	5,491	0	0	(686)	4,805	4,805
2019	52	18.31	0	5,656	0	0	(706)	4,949	4,949
2020	53	19.31	0	5,825	0	0	(727)	5,098	4,986
2021	54	20.31	0	6,000	0	0	(749)	5,251	4,929
2022	55	21.31	0	6,180	0	0	(772)	5,408	4,872
2023	56	22.31	0	6,366	0	0	(795)	5,571	4,816
2024	57	23.31	0	6,556	0	0	(819)	5,738	4,760
2025	58	24.31	0	6,753	0	0	(843)	5,910	4,705
2026	59	25.31	0	6,956	0	0	(869)	6,087	4,651
2027	60	26.31	0	4,179	0	0	(522)	3,657	2,682
2028	61	27.31	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
2029	62	28.31	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
2030	63	29.31	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
2031	64	30.31	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
2032	65	31.31	61,000	0	(5,031)	(14,748)	(5,147)	36,074	21,535
2033	66	32.31	146,400	0	(12,074)	(35,395)	(12,353)	86,578	49,600
2034	67	33.31	146,400	0	(12,074)	(35,395)	(12,353)	86,578	47,601
2035	68	34.31	146,400	0	(12,074)	(35,395)	(12,353)	86,578	45,682
2036	69	35.31	146,400	0	(12,074)	(35,395)	(12,353)	86,578	43,841
2037	70	36.31	146,400	0	(12,074)	(35,395)	(12,353)	86,578	42,074
2038	71	37.31	146,400	0	(12,074)	(35,395)	(12,353)	86,578	40,378
2039	72	38.31	146,400	0	(12,074)	(35,395)	(12,353)	86,578	38,750
2040	73	39.31	146,400	0	(12,074)	(35,395)	(12,353)	86,578	37,188
2041	74	40.31	146,400	0	(12,074)	(35,395)	(12,353)	86,578	35,689
2042	75	41.31	146,400	0	(12,074)	(35,395)	(12,353)	86,578	34,251
2043	76	42.31	146,400	0	(12,074)	(35,395)	(12,353)	86,578	32,870
2044	77	43.31	146,400	0	(12,074)	(35,395)	(12,353)	86,578	31,545
2045	78	44.31	134,200	0	(11,068)	(32,445)	(11,324)	79,363	27,751
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$1,952,000</b>	<b>\$124,283</b>	<b>(\$160,987)</b>	<b>(\$471,932)</b>	<b>(\$180,226)</b>	<b>\$1,263,138</b>	<b>\$631,198</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MRS. JENNIFER HOWLEY**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	34	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	35	1.31			0	0
2003	36	2.31			0	0
2004	37	3.31			0	0
2005	38	4.31			0	0
2006	39	5.31			0	0
2007	40	6.31			0	0
2008	41	7.31			0	0
2009	42	8.31			0	0
2010	43	9.31			0	0
2011	44	10.31			0	0
2012	45	11.31			0	0
2013	46	12.31			0	0
2014	47	13.31			0	0
2015	48	14.31			0	0
2016	49	15.31			0	0
2017	50	16.31			0	0
2018	51	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	4.2%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**BABY HOWLEY**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$1,224,118
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	37,399
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$1,261,517</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
33,864	3.0%	12.250%	2,472	71.628%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**BABY HOWLEY**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	20	0.31	1.00000	\$10,384	\$758	\$0	(\$1,272)	(\$6,527)	\$3,343	\$3,343
2002	21	1.31	1.09263	37,001	2,701	(1,045)	(4,397)	(22,558)	11,701	11,701
2003	22	2.31	1.09055	40,351	2,945	(1,140)	(4,795)	(24,601)	12,761	12,761
2004	23	3.31	1.08847	43,921	3,206	(1,241)	(5,219)	(26,778)	13,890	13,890
2005	24	4.31	1.08640	47,716	3,483	(1,348)	(5,670)	(29,091)	15,090	15,090
2006	25	5.31	1.08434	51,740	3,777	(1,461)	(6,148)	(31,545)	16,363	16,363
2007	26	6.31	1.08227	55,997	4,088	(1,582)	(6,654)	(34,140)	17,709	17,709
2008	27	7.31	1.08021	60,488	4,415	(1,709)	(7,188)	(36,879)	19,129	19,129
2009	28	8.31	1.07816	65,216	4,761	(1,842)	(7,749)	(39,761)	20,624	20,624
2010	29	9.31	1.07611	70,179	5,123	(1,982)	(8,339)	(42,787)	22,194	22,194
2011	30	10.31	1.07406	75,377	5,502	(2,129)	(8,957)	(45,956)	23,837	23,837
2012	31	11.31	1.07201	80,805	5,898	(2,282)	(9,602)	(49,265)	25,554	25,554
2013	32	12.31	1.06997	86,459	6,311	(2,442)	(10,273)	(52,712)	27,342	27,342
2014	33	13.31	1.06794	92,333	6,740	(2,608)	(10,971)	(56,293)	29,200	29,200
2015	34	14.31	1.06591	98,418	7,184	(2,780)	(11,694)	(60,003)	31,124	31,124
2016	35	15.31	1.06388	104,704	7,643	(2,958)	(12,441)	(63,836)	33,112	33,112
2017	36	16.31	1.06185	111,181	8,116	(3,140)	(13,211)	(67,785)	35,160	35,160
2018	37	17.31	1.05983	117,833	8,601	(3,328)	(14,001)	(71,840)	37,264	37,264
2019	38	18.31	1.05781	124,645	9,099	(3,521)	(14,811)	(75,994)	39,418	39,418
2020	39	19.31	1.05580	131,601	9,606	(3,717)	(15,637)	(80,234)	41,618	40,704
2021	40	20.31	1.05379	138,680	10,123	(3,917)	(16,479)	(84,550)	43,857	41,164
2022	41	21.31	1.05179	145,862	10,647	(4,120)	(17,332)	(88,929)	46,128	41,551
2023	42	22.31	1.04979	153,123	11,178	(4,325)	(18,195)	(93,356)	48,425	41,862
2024	43	23.31	1.04779	160,441	11,712	(4,532)	(19,064)	(97,818)	50,739	42,094
2025	44	24.31	1.04579	167,788	12,248	(4,739)	(19,937)	(102,297)	53,062	42,247
2026	45	25.31	1.04380	175,138	12,785	(4,947)	(20,811)	(106,778)	55,387	42,320
2027	46	26.31	1.04182	182,462	13,319	(5,154)	(21,681)	(111,243)	57,703	42,313
2028	47	27.31	1.03984	189,730	13,850	(5,359)	(22,545)	(115,675)	60,001	42,225
2029	48	28.31	1.03786	196,913	14,374	(5,562)	(23,398)	(120,054)	62,273	42,057
2030	49	29.31	1.03588	203,978	14,890	(5,762)	(24,238)	(124,361)	64,507	41,810
2031	50	30.31	1.03391	210,895	15,395	(5,957)	(25,060)	(128,579)	66,695	41,486
2032	51	31.31	1.03194	217,632	15,886	(6,147)	(25,860)	(132,686)	68,825	41,085
2033	52	32.31	1.03000	224,161	16,363	(6,332)	(26,636)	(136,666)	70,890	40,612
2034	53	33.31	1.03000	230,886	16,854	(6,522)	(27,435)	(140,766)	73,017	40,144
2035	54	34.31	1.03000	237,812	17,360	(6,717)	(28,258)	(144,989)	75,207	39,682
2036	55	35.31	1.03000	244,946	17,880	(6,919)	(29,106)	(149,339)	77,463	39,225
2037	56	36.31	1.03000	252,295	18,417	(7,126)	(29,979)	(153,819)	79,787	38,773
2038	57	37.31	1.03000	259,864	18,969	(7,340)	(30,878)	(158,434)	82,181	38,327
2039	58	37.56	1.03000	66,915	4,885	(1,890)	(7,951)	(40,797)	21,162	9,618
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$5,165,866</b>	<b>\$377,092</b>	<b>(\$145,625)</b>	<b>(\$613,872)</b>	<b>(\$3,149,719)</b>	<b>\$1,633,742</b>	<b>\$1,224,118</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	401(k) Contrib. Rate	Pension Contrib. Rate
3.0%	12.250%	71.628%	0.000%	4.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS****BABY HOWLEY**

SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	401 (K)	PENSION	VESTED PENSION	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	20	0.31	\$0	\$364	\$0	\$0	(\$261)	\$103	\$103
2002	21	1.31	0	1,299	0	0	(930)	368	368
2003	22	2.31	0	1,374	0	0	(984)	390	390
2004	23	3.31	0	1,495	0	0	(1,071)	424	424
2005	24	4.31	0	1,625	0	0	(1,164)	461	461
2006	25	5.31	0	1,762	0	0	(1,262)	500	500
2007	26	6.31	0	1,907	0	0	(1,366)	541	541
2008	27	7.31	0	2,059	0	0	(1,475)	584	584
2009	28	8.31	0	2,220	0	0	(1,590)	630	630
2010	29	9.31	0	2,389	0	0	(1,711)	678	678
2011	30	10.31	0	2,566	0	0	(1,838)	728	728
2012	31	11.31	0	2,751	0	0	(1,971)	781	781
2013	32	12.31	0	2,944	0	0	(2,108)	835	835
2014	33	13.31	0	3,144	0	0	(2,252)	892	892
2015	34	14.31	0	3,351	0	0	(2,400)	951	951
2016	35	15.31	0	3,565	0	0	(2,553)	1,011	1,011
2017	36	16.31	0	3,785	0	0	(2,711)	1,074	1,074
2018	37	17.31	0	4,012	0	0	(2,874)	1,138	1,138
2019	38	18.31	0	4,244	0	0	(3,040)	1,204	1,204
2020	39	19.31	0	4,481	0	0	(3,209)	1,271	1,243
2021	40	20.31	0	4,722	0	0	(3,382)	1,340	1,257
2022	41	21.31	0	4,966	0	0	(3,557)	1,409	1,269
2023	42	22.31	0	5,213	0	0	(3,734)	1,479	1,279
2024	43	23.31	0	5,463	0	0	(3,913)	1,550	1,286
2025	44	24.31	0	5,713	0	0	(4,092)	1,621	1,290
2026	45	25.31	0	5,963	0	0	(4,271)	1,692	1,293
2027	46	26.31	0	6,212	0	0	(4,450)	1,763	1,292
2028	47	27.31	0	6,460	0	0	(4,627)	1,833	1,290
2029	48	28.31	0	6,704	0	0	(4,802)	1,902	1,285
2030	49	29.31	0	6,945	0	0	(4,974)	1,970	1,277
2031	50	30.31	0	7,180	0	0	(5,143)	2,037	1,267
2032	51	31.31	0	7,410	0	0	(5,307)	2,102	1,255
2033	52	32.31	0	7,632	0	0	(5,467)	2,165	1,241
2034	53	33.31	0	7,861	0	0	(5,631)	2,230	1,226
2035	54	34.31	0	8,097	0	0	(5,800)	2,297	1,212
2036	55	35.31	0	8,340	0	0	(5,974)	2,366	1,198
2037	56	36.31	0	8,590	0	0	(6,153)	2,437	1,184
2038	57	37.31	0	8,848	0	0	(6,337)	2,510	1,171
2039	58	38.31	0	2,278	0	0	(1,632)	646	289
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$175,932</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$126,017)</b>	<b>\$49,915</b>	<b>\$37,399</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****BABY HOWLEY**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	20	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	21	1.31			0	0
2003	22	2.31			0	0
2004	23	3.31			0	0
2005	24	4.31			0	0
2006	25	5.31			0	0
2007	26	6.31			0	0
2008	27	7.31			0	0
2009	28	8.31			0	0
2010	29	9.31			0	0
2011	30	10.31			0	0
2012	31	11.31			0	0
2013	32	12.31			0	0
2014	33	13.31			0	0
2015	34	14.31			0	0
2016	35	15.31			0	0
2017	36	16.31			0	0
2018	37	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-7**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. John Michael Griffin**

December 11, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **May 29, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile



VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES  
MR. JOHN MICHAEL GRIFFIN**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$5,208,941
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	249,088
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	216,758
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$5,674,787</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
151,145	3.0%	23.520%	25,359	12.487%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. JOHN MICHAEL GRIFFIN**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	33	0.31	1.00000	\$46,347	\$7,776	\$0	(\$10,901)	(\$2,367)	\$40,855	\$40,855
2002	34	1.31	1.06591	161,106	27,030	(4,317)	(36,755)	(7,982)	139,082	139,082
2003	35	2.31	1.06388	171,397	28,757	(4,592)	(39,103)	(8,492)	147,966	147,966
2004	36	3.31	1.06185	181,998	30,535	(4,876)	(41,522)	(9,017)	157,118	157,118
2005	37	4.31	1.05983	192,887	32,362	(5,168)	(44,006)	(9,557)	166,518	166,518
2006	38	5.31	1.05781	204,039	34,233	(5,467)	(46,550)	(10,110)	176,146	176,146
2007	39	6.31	1.05580	215,425	36,144	(5,772)	(49,148)	(10,674)	185,975	185,975
2008	40	7.31	1.05379	227,013	38,088	(6,082)	(51,792)	(11,248)	195,979	195,979
2009	41	8.31	1.05179	238,769	40,060	(6,397)	(54,474)	(11,830)	206,128	206,128
2010	42	9.31	1.04979	250,657	42,055	(6,716)	(57,186)	(16,183)	212,627	212,627
2011	43	10.31	1.04779	262,635	44,064	(7,037)	(59,919)	(16,956)	222,788	222,788
2012	44	11.31	1.04579	274,662	46,082	(7,359)	(62,663)	(25,442)	225,280	225,280
2013	45	12.31	1.04380	286,694	48,101	(7,682)	(65,407)	(26,557)	235,149	235,149
2014	46	13.31	1.04182	298,683	50,112	(8,003)	(68,143)	(27,668)	244,982	244,982
2015	47	14.31	1.03984	310,581	52,109	(8,322)	(70,857)	(28,770)	254,741	254,741
2016	48	15.31	1.03786	322,338	54,081	(8,637)	(73,539)	(29,859)	264,384	264,384
2017	49	16.31	1.03588	333,904	56,022	(8,946)	(76,178)	(30,930)	273,871	273,871
2018	50	17.31	1.03391	345,227	57,921	(9,250)	(78,761)	(31,979)	283,158	283,158
2019	51	18.31	1.03194	356,254	59,772	(9,545)	(81,277)	(33,000)	292,203	292,203
2020	52	19.31	1.03000	366,942	61,565	(9,832)	(83,716)	(33,991)	300,969	294,814
2021	53	20.31	1.03000	377,950	63,412	(10,127)	(86,227)	(35,010)	309,998	292,260
2022	54	21.31	1.03000	389,289	65,314	(10,430)	(88,814)	(36,061)	319,298	289,728
2023	55	22.31	1.03000	400,967	67,273	(10,743)	(91,478)	(37,142)	328,877	287,219
2024	56	22.72	1.03000	172,096	28,874	(4,611)	(39,263)	(15,942)	141,154	119,973
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$6,387,859</b>	<b>\$1,071,741</b>	<b>(\$169,911)</b>	<b>(\$1,457,679)</b>	<b>(\$506,767)</b>	<b>\$5,325,243</b>	<b>\$5,208,941</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	12.487%	0.000%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MR. JOHN MICHAEL GRIFFIN**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	AFTER-TAX OTHER	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	33	0.31	\$0	\$2,673	\$0	(\$179)	\$2,494	\$2,494
2002	34	1.31	0	8,980	0	(600)	8,380	8,380
2003	35	2.31	0	9,249	0	(618)	8,631	8,631
2004	36	3.31	0	9,527	0	(636)	8,890	8,890
2005	37	4.31	0	9,813	0	(655)	9,158	9,158
2006	38	5.31	0	10,107	0	(675)	9,432	9,432
2007	39	6.31	0	10,411	0	(695)	9,715	9,715
2008	40	7.31	0	10,722	0	(716)	10,006	10,006
2009	41	8.31	0	11,044	0	(738)	10,306	10,306
2010	42	9.31	0	11,375	0	(990)	10,385	10,385
2011	43	10.31	0	11,717	0	(1,020)	10,698	10,698
2012	44	11.31	0	12,069	0	(1,507)	10,562	10,562
2013	45	12.31	0	12,430	0	(1,552)	10,878	10,878
2014	46	13.31	0	12,804	0	(1,599)	11,205	11,205
2015	47	14.31	0	13,188	0	(1,647)	11,541	11,541
2016	48	15.31	0	13,583	0	(1,696)	11,887	11,887
2017	49	16.31	0	13,990	0	(1,747)	12,243	12,243
2018	50	17.31	0	14,410	0	(1,799)	12,611	12,611
2019	51	18.31	0	14,842	0	(1,853)	12,989	12,989
2020	52	19.31	0	15,287	0	(1,909)	13,378	13,105
2021	53	20.31	0	15,747	0	(1,966)	13,781	12,992
2022	54	21.31	0	16,219	0	(2,025)	14,194	12,879
2023	55	22.31	0	16,704	0	(2,086)	14,619	12,767
2024	56	22.72	0	7,170	0	(895)	6,274	5,333
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$284,060</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$29,803)</b>	<b>\$254,257</b>	<b>\$249,088</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MR. JOHN MICHAEL GRIFFIN**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	33	0.31	\$3,337	\$4,784	\$8,121	\$8,121
2002	34	1.31	10,884	15,600	26,484	26,484
2003	35	2.31	10,884	15,600	26,484	26,484
2004	36	3.31	10,884	15,600	26,484	26,484
2005	37	4.31	10,884	10,869	21,753	21,753
2006	38	5.31	10,884	15,600	26,484	26,484
2007	39	6.31	10,884	15,600	26,484	26,484
2008	40	7.31	10,884	15,600	26,484	26,484
2009	41	8.31	7,874	2,380	10,254	10,254
2010	42	9.31	7,056	2,316	9,372	9,372
2011	43	9.94	6,888	1,466	8,354	8,354
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$101,344</b>	<b>\$115,414</b>	<b>\$216,758</b>	<b>\$216,758</b>

# **Exhibit B-8**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Ernest James**

December 11, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **June 5, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MR. ERNEST JAMES**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$641,691
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	83,533
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$725,225</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
56,186	3.0%	16.100%	2,573	62.644%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. ERNEST JAMES**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	40	0.31	1.00000	\$17,229	\$789	\$0	(\$2,774)	(\$9,055)	\$6,189	\$6,189
2002	41	1.31	1.05179	59,096	2,706	(1,556)	(9,229)	(30,128)	20,890	20,890
2003	42	2.31	1.04979	62,038	2,841	(1,633)	(9,689)	(31,628)	21,930	21,930
2004	43	3.31	1.04779	65,003	2,977	(1,711)	(10,152)	(33,140)	22,978	22,978
2005	44	4.31	1.04579	67,980	3,113	(1,789)	(10,616)	(34,657)	24,030	24,030
2006	45	5.31	1.04380	70,958	3,249	(1,868)	(11,081)	(36,175)	25,082	25,082
2007	46	6.31	1.04182	73,925	3,385	(1,946)	(11,545)	(37,688)	26,131	26,131
2008	47	7.31	1.03984	76,870	3,520	(2,023)	(12,005)	(39,190)	27,172	27,172
2009	48	8.31	1.03786	79,780	3,653	(2,100)	(12,459)	(40,673)	28,201	28,201
2010	49	9.31	1.03588	82,642	3,785	(2,175)	(12,906)	(42,133)	29,213	29,213
2011	50	10.31	1.03391	85,445	3,913	(2,249)	(13,344)	(43,561)	30,203	30,203
2012	51	11.31	1.03194	88,174	4,038	(2,321)	(13,770)	(44,953)	31,168	31,168
2013	52	12.31	1.03000	90,819	4,159	(2,391)	(14,183)	(46,301)	32,103	32,103
2014	53	13.31	1.03000	93,544	4,284	(2,462)	(14,609)	(47,690)	33,066	33,066
2015	54	14.31	1.03000	96,350	4,412	(2,536)	(15,047)	(49,121)	34,058	34,058
2016	55	15.31	1.03000	99,241	4,545	(2,612)	(15,498)	(50,595)	35,080	35,080
2017	56	16.31	1.03000	102,218	4,681	(2,691)	(15,963)	(52,113)	36,132	36,132
2018	57	17.31	1.03000	105,284	4,821	(2,771)	(16,442)	(53,676)	37,216	37,216
2019	58	18.31	1.03000	108,443	4,966	(2,855)	(16,936)	(55,286)	38,333	38,333
2020	59	19.31	1.03000	111,696	5,115	(2,940)	(17,444)	(56,945)	39,483	38,675
2021	60	20.31	1.03000	115,047	5,269	(3,028)	(17,967)	(58,653)	40,667	38,340
2022	61	20.97	1.03000	78,999	3,618	(2,079)	(12,337)	(40,275)	27,925	25,500
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$1,830,780</b>	<b>\$83,840</b>	<b>(\$47,737)</b>	<b>(\$285,996)</b>	<b>(\$933,637)</b>	<b>\$647,250</b>	<b>\$641,691</b>



Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	16.100%	62.644%	0.000%	0.000%

## EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS

MR. ERNEST JAMES

SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PROJECTED PENSION	VESTED PENSION	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	40	0.31	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
2002	41	1.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2003	42	2.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2004	43	3.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2005	44	4.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2006	45	5.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2007	46	6.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2008	47	7.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2009	48	8.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2010	49	9.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2011	50	10.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2012	51	11.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2013	52	12.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2014	53	13.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2015	54	14.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2016	55	15.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2017	56	16.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2018	57	17.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2019	58	18.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2020	59	19.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2021	60	20.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2022	61	21.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2023	62	22.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2024	63	23.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2025	64	24.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2026	65	25.31	11,736	(1,000)	(1,728)	(5,643)	3,365	2,620
2027	66	26.31	35,208	(3,000)	(5,185)	(16,928)	10,094	7,565
2028	67	27.31	35,208	(3,000)	(5,185)	(16,928)	10,094	7,281
2029	68	28.31	35,208	(3,000)	(5,185)	(16,928)	10,094	7,008
2030	69	29.31	35,208	(3,000)	(5,185)	(16,928)	10,094	6,745
2031	70	30.31	35,208	(3,000)	(5,185)	(16,928)	10,094	6,491
2032	71	31.31	35,208	(3,000)	(5,185)	(16,928)	10,094	6,248
2033	72	32.31	35,208	(3,000)	(5,185)	(16,928)	10,094	6,013
2034	73	33.31	35,208	(3,000)	(5,185)	(16,928)	10,094	5,788
2035	74	34.31	35,208	(3,000)	(5,185)	(16,928)	10,094	5,570
2036	75	35.31	35,208	(3,000)	(5,185)	(16,928)	10,094	5,361
2037	76	36.31	35,208	(3,000)	(5,185)	(16,928)	10,094	5,160
2038	77	37.31	35,208	(3,000)	(5,185)	(16,928)	10,094	4,966
2039	78	38.31	35,208	(3,000)	(5,185)	(16,928)	10,094	4,780
2040	79	38.72	14,670	(1,250)	(2,161)	(7,053)	4,206	1,938
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$484,110</b>	<b>(\$41,250)</b>	<b>(\$71,300)</b>	<b>(\$232,761)</b>	<b>\$138,799</b>	<b>\$83,533</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MR. ERNEST JAMES**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	40	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	41	1.31			0	0
2003	42	2.31			0	0
2004	43	3.31			0	0
2005	44	4.31			0	0
2006	45	5.31			0	0
2007	46	6.31			0	0
2008	47	7.31			0	0
2009	48	8.31			0	0
2010	49	9.31			0	0
2011	50	10.31			0	0
2012	51	11.31			0	0
2013	52	12.31			0	0
2014	53	13.31			0	0
2015	54	14.31			0	0
2016	55	15.31			0	0
2017	56	16.31			0	0
2018	57	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-9**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Jon Grabowski**

December 11, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **May 20, 2004**. However, there are no details about the assumptions made for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values. Therefore, the next best thing is to accumulate the award determined by **The Fund** with interest to valuation date chosen of **January 1, 2020**.

**The Fund** awarded \$4,442,304 on **May 20, 2004** or 15.6167 years before **January 1, 2020**. At the conservative interest rate of 3.9%, the calculated Economic Loss amount is \$8,073,992.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

# **Exhibit B-10**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mrs. Lisa Reinhart Gordenstein**

December 11, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **June 27, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	6.4%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MRS. LISA REINHART GORDENSTEIN**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$7,038,920
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	410,298
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	711,722
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$8,160,941</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
393,827	3.0%	32.780%	11,160	12.210%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MRS. LISA REINHART GORDENSTEIN**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	42	0.31	1.00000	\$120,763	\$3,422	\$0	(\$39,586)	(\$7,286)	\$77,313	\$77,313
2002	43	1.31	1.04779	412,647	11,494	(8,553)	(131,208)	(24,151)	260,230	260,230
2003	44	2.31	1.04579	431,544	11,839	(8,941)	(137,216)	(25,256)	271,969	271,969
2004	45	3.31	1.04380	450,447	12,194	(9,330)	(143,227)	(26,363)	283,722	283,722
2005	46	4.31	1.04182	469,284	12,560	(9,717)	(149,216)	(27,465)	295,446	295,446
2006	47	5.31	1.03984	487,978	12,937	(10,101)	(155,160)	(28,559)	307,094	307,094
2007	48	6.31	1.03786	506,451	13,325	(10,482)	(161,034)	(29,641)	318,620	318,620
2008	49	7.31	1.03588	524,623	13,725	(10,856)	(166,812)	(29,169)	331,511	331,511
2009	50	8.31	1.03391	542,413	14,137	(11,223)	(172,469)	(30,158)	342,700	342,700
2010	51	9.31	1.03194	559,739	14,561	(11,581)	(177,978)	(31,121)	353,619	353,619
2011	52	10.31	1.03000	576,532	14,998	(11,929)	(183,317)	(32,055)	364,228	364,228
2012	53	11.31	1.03000	593,827	15,448	(12,287)	(188,817)	(33,017)	375,155	375,155
2013	54	12.31	1.03000	611,642	15,911	(12,655)	(194,481)	(34,007)	386,410	386,410
2014	55	13.31	1.03000	629,992	16,388	(13,035)	(200,316)	(39,954)	393,075	393,075
2015	56	14.31	1.03000	648,891	16,880	(13,426)	(206,325)	(41,152)	404,868	404,868
2016	57	15.31	1.03000	668,358	17,386	(13,829)	(212,515)	(42,387)	417,014	417,014
2017	58	16.31	1.03000	688,409	17,908	(14,244)	(218,891)	(43,658)	429,524	429,524
2018	59	17.31	1.03000	709,061	18,445	(14,671)	(225,457)	(56,452)	430,926	430,926
2019	60	18.31	1.03000	730,333	18,999	(15,111)	(232,221)	(58,146)	443,854	443,854
2020	61	19.31	1.03000	752,243	19,569	(15,564)	(239,188)	(59,890)	457,169	442,139
2021	62	19.56	1.03000	193,703	5,039	(4,008)	(61,591)	(15,422)	117,721	109,506
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$11,308,879</b>	<b>\$297,166</b>	<b>(\$231,543)</b>	<b>(\$3,597,027)</b>	<b>(\$715,309)</b>	<b>\$7,062,166</b>	<b>\$7,038,920</b>



Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	12.210%	0.000%	0.000%

## ALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS

JINHART GORDENSTEIN

MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	VESTED PENSION	SURVIVOR PENSION	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	42	0.31	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
2002	43	1.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2003	44	2.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2004	45	3.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2005	46	4.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2006	47	5.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2007	48	6.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2008	49	7.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2009	50	8.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2010	51	9.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2011	52	10.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2012	53	11.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2013	54	12.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2014	55	13.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2015	56	14.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2016	57	15.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2017	58	16.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2018	59	17.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2019	60	18.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2020	61	19.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2021	62	20.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2022	63	21.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2023	64	22.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2024	65	23.31	17,954	(2,402)	856	(1,899)	14,510	10,950
2025	66	24.31	71,816	(9,606)	3,426	(7,596)	58,039	41,167
2026	67	25.31	71,816	(9,606)	3,426	(7,596)	58,039	38,692
2027	68	26.31	71,816	(9,606)	3,426	(7,596)	58,039	36,365
2028	69	27.31	71,816	(9,606)	3,426	(7,596)	58,039	34,179
2029	70	28.31	71,816	(9,606)	3,426	(7,596)	58,039	32,124
2030	71	29.31	71,816	(9,606)	3,426	(7,596)	58,039	30,192
2031	72	30.31	71,816	(9,606)	3,426	(7,596)	58,039	28,377
2032	73	31.31	71,816	(9,606)	3,426	(7,596)	58,039	26,671
2033	74	32.31	71,816	(9,606)	3,426	(7,596)	58,039	25,067
2034	75	33.31	71,816	(9,606)	3,426	(7,596)	58,039	23,560
2035	76	34.31	71,816	(9,606)	3,426	(7,596)	58,039	22,143
2036	77	35.31	71,816	(9,606)	3,426	(7,596)	58,039	20,812
2037	78	36.31	71,816	(9,606)	3,426	(7,596)	58,039	19,560
2038	79	37.31	53,862	(7,205)	3,426	(5,697)	44,386	14,059
2039	80	38.31	0	0	3,426	0	3,426	1,020
2040	81	39.31	0	0	3,426	0	3,426	958
2041	82	40.31	0	0	3,426	0	3,426	901
2042	83	41.31	0	0	3,426	0	3,426	847
2043	84	42.31	0	0	3,426	0	3,426	796
2044	85	43.31	0	0	3,426	0	3,426	748
2045	86	44.31	0	0	3,426	0	3,426	703
2046	87	44.92	0	0	2,090	0	2,090	408
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$1,005,424</b>	<b>(\$134,485)</b>	<b>\$74,882</b>	<b>(\$106,344)</b>	<b>\$839,477</b>	<b>\$410,298</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MRS. LISA REINHART GORDENSTEIN**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	PT NANNY	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	42	0.31	\$4,927	\$1,531	\$7,981	\$14,439	\$14,439
2002	43	1.31	16,068	4,992	26,028	47,088	47,088
2003	44	2.31	16,068	4,992	26,028	47,088	47,088
2004	45	3.31	16,068	4,992	26,028	47,088	47,088
2005	46	4.31	16,068	4,992	26,028	47,088	47,088
2006	47	5.31	16,068	4,992	26,028	47,088	47,088
2007	48	6.31	16,068	4,992	26,028	47,088	47,088
2008	49	7.31	16,068	4,992	26,028	47,088	47,088
2009	50	8.31	16,068	4,992	26,028	47,088	47,088
2010	51	9.31	16,068	4,992	26,028	47,088	47,088
2011	52	10.31	16,068	4,992	26,028	47,088	47,088
2012	53	11.31	16,068	4,992	26,028	47,088	47,088
2013	54	12.31	15,635	4,727	26,028	46,389	46,389
2014	55	13.31	13,776	3,588	26,028	43,392	43,392
2015	56	14.31	13,776	3,588	26,028	43,392	43,392
2016	57	15.31	13,776	3,588	26,028	43,392	43,392
2017	58	15.37	873	227	1,649	2,749	2,749
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$239,511</b>	<b>\$72,161</b>	<b>\$400,050</b>	<b>\$711,722</b>	<b>\$711,722</b>

# **Exhibit B-11**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Mohammad Salman Hamdani**

January 2, 2020

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **October 9, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,



John E. Beauzile

<b>Valuation Date</b>	01-Jan-20
<b>Discount Rate</b>	4.2%

**Exhibit 1. Summary of Economic Damages**  
**Mr. Mohammad Salman Hamdani**

	<b><u>Present Value</u></b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$2,938,624
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	127,508
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	<u>0</u>
<b>Total</b>	<b><u><u>\$3,066,133</u></u></b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
33,786	3.0%	12.250%	2,400	48.04-71.63%

**Exhibit 2a. Present Value of Lost Earnings**  
**Mr. Mohammad Salman Hamdani**  
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Age-Specific Growth Factor	Earnings	Benefits	Unempl. Adj.	Taxes	Consumption	Net Earnings	PV of Net Earnings
2001	24	0.31	1.00000	\$10,360	\$736	\$0	(\$1,269)	(\$6,512)	\$3,315	\$3,315
2002	25	1.31	1.08434	36,634	2,472	(1,029)	(4,353)	(22,335)	11,389	11,389
2003	26	2.31	1.08227	39,648	2,547	(1,111)	(4,711)	(24,173)	12,200	12,200
2004	27	3.31	1.08021	0	2,622	(69)	0	0	2,553	2,553
2005	28	4.31	1.07816	0	2,702	(71)	0	0	2,631	2,631
2006	29	5.31	1.07611	0	2,782	(73)	0	0	2,709	2,709
2007	30	6.31	1.07406	0	2,866	(75)	0	0	2,791	2,791
2008	31	7.31	1.07201	57,213	2,952	(1,584)	(6,798)	(34,882)	16,901	16,901
2009	32	8.31	1.06997	61,216	3,040	(1,692)	(7,274)	(37,322)	17,968	17,968
2010	33	9.31	1.06794	65,375	3,131	(1,803)	(7,768)	(39,858)	19,077	19,077
2011	34	10.31	1.06591	69,683	3,225	(1,919)	(8,280)	(42,484)	20,224	20,224
2012	35	11.31	2.61320	182,097	3,323	(4,881)	(21,638)	(74,459)	84,442	84,442
2013	36	12.31	1.06185	193,359	3,421	(5,180)	(22,976)	(79,064)	89,560	89,560
2014	37	13.31	1.05983	204,928	3,524	(5,487)	(24,351)	(83,795)	94,819	94,819
2015	38	14.31	1.05781	216,777	3,629	(5,802)	(25,759)	(88,640)	100,205	100,205
2016	39	15.31	1.05580	228,873	3,739	(6,124)	(27,196)	(93,586)	105,707	105,707
2017	40	16.31	1.05379	241,185	3,852	(6,451)	(28,659)	(98,620)	111,307	111,307
2018	41	17.31	1.05179	253,675	3,967	(6,782)	(30,143)	(103,728)	116,989	116,989
2019	42	18.31	1.04979	266,303	4,086	(7,118)	(31,643)	(108,891)	122,736	122,736
2020	43	19.31	1.04779	279,030	4,209	(7,456)	(33,156)	(114,095)	128,532	128,532
2021	44	20.31	1.04579	291,809	4,335	(7,796)	(34,674)	(119,320)	134,353	134,353
2022	45	21.31	1.04380	304,590	4,465	(8,136)	(36,193)	(124,547)	140,180	140,180
2023	46	22.31	1.04182	317,329	4,598	(8,475)	(37,707)	(129,756)	145,990	145,990
2024	47	23.31	1.03984	329,969	4,737	(8,811)	(39,209)	(134,924)	151,762	151,762
2025	48	24.31	1.03786	342,460	4,879	(9,144)	(40,693)	(140,032)	157,471	157,471
2026	49	25.31	1.03588	354,747	5,025	(9,471)	(42,153)	(145,056)	163,092	163,092
2027	50	26.31	1.03391	366,777	5,174	(9,792)	(43,582)	(149,975)	168,602	168,602
2028	51	27.31	1.03194	378,494	5,331	(10,104)	(44,975)	(154,766)	173,980	173,980
2029	52	28.31	1.03000	389,848	5,491	(10,407)	(46,324)	(159,409)	179,199	179,199
2030	53	29.31	1.03000	401,545	5,655	(10,720)	(47,714)	(164,191)	184,575	184,575
2031	54	30.31	1.03000	413,589	5,826	(11,041)	(49,145)	(169,116)	190,113	190,113
2032	55	31.31	1.03000	425,998	5,999	(11,372)	(50,619)	(174,190)	195,815	195,815
2033	56	32.31	1.03000	438,778	6,179	(11,713)	(52,138)	(179,416)	201,690	201,690
2034	57	33.31	1.03000	451,943	6,364	(12,065)	(53,702)	(184,799)	207,741	207,741
2035	58	34.31	1.03000	465,498	6,558	(12,427)	(55,313)	(190,342)	213,975	213,975
2036	59	34.81	1.03000	239,734	3,378	(6,400)	(28,486)	(98,027)	110,199	110,199
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$8,319,464</b>	<b>\$146,819</b>	<b>(\$222,583)</b>	<b>(\$988,598)</b>	<b>(\$3,470,309)</b>	<b>\$3,784,793</b>	<b>\$2,938,624</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	12.250%	48.04-71.63%	4.000%	0.000%

**Exhibit 3a. Present Value of Lost Pension Benefits**  
**Mr. Mohammad Salman Hamdani**  
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Pension Contrib.	Net Pension (Projected-Vested)	Taxes	Consumption	Net Loss	PV of Net Loss
2001	24	0.31	\$414	\$0	\$0	(\$297)	\$118	\$118
2002	25	1.31	1,421	0	0	(1,018)	403	403
2003	26	2.31	1,538	0	0	(1,102)	436	436
2004	27	3.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2005	28	4.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2006	29	5.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2007	30	6.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2008	31	7.31	2,220	0	0	(1,590)	630	630
2009	32	8.31	2,375	0	0	(1,701)	674	674
2010	33	9.31	2,537	0	0	(1,817)	720	720
2011	34	10.31	2,704	0	0	(1,937)	767	767
2012	35	11.31	7,065	0	0	(3,394)	3,671	3,671
2013	36	12.31	7,502	0	0	(3,604)	3,898	3,898
2014	37	13.31	7,951	0	0	(3,820)	4,131	4,131
2015	38	14.31	8,411	0	0	(4,041)	4,370	4,370
2016	39	15.31	8,880	0	0	(4,266)	4,614	4,614
2017	40	16.31	9,358	0	0	(4,496)	4,862	4,862
2018	41	17.31	9,843	0	0	(4,728)	5,114	5,114
2019	42	18.31	10,333	0	0	(4,964)	5,369	5,369
2020	43	19.31	10,826	0	0	(5,201)	5,625	5,502
2021	44	20.31	11,322	0	0	(5,439)	5,883	5,522
2022	45	21.31	11,818	0	0	(5,677)	6,141	5,531
2023	46	22.31	12,312	0	0	(5,915)	6,398	5,531
2024	47	23.31	12,803	0	0	(6,150)	6,652	5,519
2025	48	24.31	13,287	0	0	(6,383)	6,904	5,497
2026	49	25.31	13,764	0	0	(6,612)	7,152	5,465
2027	50	26.31	14,231	0	0	(6,836)	7,394	5,422
2028	51	27.31	14,686	0	0	(7,055)	7,631	5,370
2029	52	28.31	15,126	0	0	(7,266)	7,860	5,308
2030	53	29.31	15,580	0	0	(7,485)	8,095	5,247
2031	54	30.31	16,047	0	0	(7,709)	8,338	5,187
2032	55	31.31	16,529	0	0	(7,940)	8,588	5,127
2033	56	32.31	17,025	0	0	(8,179)	8,846	5,068
2034	57	33.31	17,535	0	0	(8,424)	9,111	5,009
2035	58	34.31	18,061	0	0	(8,677)	9,385	4,952
2036	59	34.81	9,302	0	0	(4,468)	4,833	2,473
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$322,808</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$158,191)</b>	<b>\$164,617</b>	<b>\$127,508</b>

**Exhibit 4a. Loss Estimated Value of Replacement Services**  
**Mr. Mohammad Salman Hamdani**

<b>Year</b>	<b>Age</b>	<b>Time Frame</b>	<b>Household Services</b>	<b>Care Services</b>	<b>Total Services</b>	<b>Present Value</b>
2001	24	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	25	1.31			0	0
2003	26	2.31			0	0
2004	27	3.31			0	0
2005	28	4.31			0	0
2006	29	5.31			0	0
2007	30	6.31			0	0
2008	31	7.31			0	0
2009	32	8.31			0	0
2010	33	9.31			0	0
2011	34	10.31			0	0
2012	35	11.31			0	0
2013	36	12.31			0	0
2014	37	13.31			0	0
2015	38	14.31			0	0
2016	39	15.31			0	0
2017	40	16.31			0	0
2018	41	17.31			0	0
2019	42	18.31			0	0
2020	43	19.31			0	0
2021	44	20.31			0	0
2022	45	21.31			0	0
2023	46	22.31			0	0
2024	47	23.31			0	0
2025	48	24.31			0	0
2026	49	25.31			0	0
2027	50	26.31			0	0
2028	51	27.31			0	0
2029	52	28.31			0	0
2030	53	29.31			0	0
2031	54	30.31			0	0
2032	55	31.31			0	0
2033	56	32.31			0	0
2034	57	33.31			0	0
2035	58	34.31			0	0
2036	59	35.06			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>



# **Exhibit B-12**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Samuel Fields**

December 11, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **May 7, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MR. SAMUEL FIELDS**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$1,552,212
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	51,673
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	830,251
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$2,434,137</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
32,892	3.0%	12.250%	4,898	26.675%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. SAMUEL FIELDS**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	36	0.31	1.00000	\$10,086	\$1,502	\$0	(\$1,236)	(\$617)	\$9,735	\$9,735
2002	37	1.31	1.05983	34,860	5,191	(1,054)	(4,142)	(2,070)	32,784	32,784
2003	38	2.31	1.05781	36,875	5,491	(1,115)	(4,382)	(2,190)	34,680	34,680
2004	39	3.31	1.05580	38,933	5,798	(1,178)	(4,626)	(2,312)	36,615	36,615
2005	40	4.31	1.05379	41,027	6,110	(1,241)	(4,875)	(2,436)	38,585	38,585
2006	41	5.31	1.05179	43,152	6,426	(1,305)	(5,128)	(2,563)	40,583	40,583
2007	42	6.31	1.04979	45,300	6,746	(1,370)	(5,383)	(2,690)	42,603	42,603
2008	43	7.31	1.04779	47,465	7,068	(1,436)	(5,640)	(2,819)	44,639	44,639
2009	44	8.31	1.04579	49,639	7,392	(1,501)	(5,898)	(2,948)	46,684	46,684
2010	45	9.31	1.04380	51,813	7,716	(1,567)	(6,157)	(3,068)	48,198	48,198
2011	46	10.31	1.04182	53,980	8,039	(1,633)	(6,414)	(3,758)	50,213	50,213
2012	47	11.31	1.03984	56,130	8,359	(1,698)	(6,670)	(3,908)	52,214	52,214
2013	48	12.31	1.03786	58,255	8,675	(1,762)	(6,922)	(4,056)	54,190	54,190
2014	49	13.31	1.03588	60,346	8,987	(1,825)	(7,171)	(5,077)	55,259	55,259
2015	50	14.31	1.03391	62,392	9,291	(1,887)	(7,414)	(5,249)	57,133	57,133
2016	51	15.31	1.03194	64,385	9,588	(1,947)	(7,651)	(6,842)	57,533	57,533
2017	52	16.31	1.03000	66,316	9,876	(2,006)	(7,880)	(7,048)	59,259	59,259
2018	53	17.31	1.03000	68,306	10,172	(2,066)	(8,116)	(9,851)	58,444	58,444
2019	54	18.31	1.03000	70,355	10,477	(2,128)	(8,360)	(10,147)	60,197	60,197
2020	55	19.31	1.03000	72,466	10,792	(2,192)	(8,611)	(10,451)	62,003	60,735
2021	56	20.31	1.03000	74,640	11,115	(2,257)	(8,869)	(10,765)	63,863	60,209
2022	57	21.31	1.03000	76,879	11,449	(2,325)	(9,135)	(17,455)	59,412	53,910
2023	58	22.31	1.03000	79,185	11,792	(2,395)	(9,409)	(17,979)	61,194	53,443
2024	59	23.31	1.03000	81,561	12,146	(2,467)	(9,691)	(18,518)	63,030	52,980
2025	60	24.31	1.03000	84,008	12,510	(2,541)	(9,982)	(19,074)	64,921	52,521
2026	61	25.31	1.03000	86,528	12,886	(2,617)	(10,282)	(19,646)	66,869	52,066
2027	62	26.31	1.03000	89,124	13,272	(2,696)	(10,590)	(20,236)	68,875	51,615
2028	63	27.31	1.03000	91,797	13,670	(2,776)	(10,908)	(20,843)	70,941	51,168
2029	64	28.31	1.03000	94,551	14,081	(2,860)	(11,235)	(21,468)	73,069	50,725
2030	65	29.31	1.03000	97,388	14,503	(2,946)	(11,572)	(22,112)	75,261	50,285
2031	66	30.31	1.03000	100,309	14,938	(3,034)	(11,919)	(22,775)	77,519	49,850
2032	67	30.97	1.03000	68,879	10,257	(2,083)	(8,185)	(15,639)	53,230	33,155
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$2,056,931</b>	<b>\$306,317</b>	<b>(\$61,907)</b>	<b>(\$244,452)</b>	<b>(\$317,152)</b>	<b>\$1,739,737</b>	<b>\$1,552,212</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	26.675%	4.000%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MR. SAMUEL FIELDS**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401(k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	36	0.31	\$403	\$0	\$0	(\$108)	\$296	\$296
2002	37	1.31	1,394	0	0	(372)	1,022	1,022
2003	38	2.31	1,431	0	0	(382)	1,049	1,049
2004	39	3.31	1,511	0	0	(403)	1,108	1,108
2005	40	4.31	1,592	0	0	(425)	1,167	1,167
2006	41	5.31	1,674	0	0	(447)	1,228	1,228
2007	42	6.31	1,758	0	0	(469)	1,289	1,289
2008	43	7.31	1,842	0	0	(491)	1,350	1,350
2009	44	8.31	1,926	0	0	(514)	1,412	1,412
2010	45	9.31	2,010	0	0	(536)	1,474	1,474
2011	46	10.31	2,094	0	0	(559)	1,536	1,536
2012	47	11.31	2,178	0	0	(581)	1,597	1,597
2013	48	12.31	2,260	0	0	(603)	1,657	1,657
2014	49	13.31	2,341	0	0	(625)	1,717	1,717
2015	50	14.31	2,421	0	0	(646)	1,775	1,775
2016	51	15.31	2,498	0	0	(666)	1,832	1,832
2017	52	16.31	2,573	0	0	(686)	1,887	1,887
2018	53	17.31	2,650	0	0	(707)	1,943	1,943
2019	54	18.31	2,730	0	0	(728)	2,002	2,002
2020	55	19.31	2,812	0	0	(750)	2,062	2,019
2021	56	20.31	2,896	0	0	(773)	2,124	2,002
2022	57	21.31	2,983	0	0	(796)	2,187	1,985
2023	58	22.31	3,072	0	0	(820)	2,253	1,967
2024	59	23.31	3,165	0	0	(844)	2,320	1,950
2025	60	24.31	3,259	0	0	(869)	2,390	1,934
2026	61	25.31	3,357	0	0	(896)	2,462	1,917
2027	62	26.31	3,458	0	0	(922)	2,536	1,900
2028	63	27.31	3,562	0	0	(950)	2,612	1,884
2029	64	28.31	3,669	0	0	(979)	2,690	1,867
2030	65	29.31	3,779	0	0	(1,008)	2,771	1,851
2031	66	30.31	3,892	0	0	(1,038)	2,854	1,835
2032	67	30.97	2,673	0	0	(713)	1,960	1,221
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$79,863</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$21,303)</b>	<b>\$58,560</b>	<b>\$51,673</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MR. SAMUEL FIELDS**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	PT NANNY	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	36	0.31	\$3,187	\$29,795	\$7,981	\$40,962	\$40,962
2002	37	1.31	10,392	15,636	26,028	52,056	52,056
2003	38	2.31	10,392	15,636	26,028	52,056	52,056
2004	39	3.31	10,392	15,636	26,028	52,056	52,056
2005	40	4.31	10,392	15,636	26,028	52,056	52,056
2006	41	5.31	10,392	15,636	26,028	52,056	52,056
2007	42	6.31	10,392	15,636	26,028	52,056	52,056
2008	43	7.31	10,392	15,636	26,028	52,056	52,056
2009	44	8.31	10,392	15,636	26,028	52,056	52,056
2010	45	9.31	10,392	15,636	26,028	52,056	52,056
2011	46	10.31	10,392	15,636	26,028	52,056	52,056
2012	47	11.31	10,392	15,636	26,028	52,056	52,056
2013	48	12.31	10,392	15,636	26,028	52,056	52,056
2014	49	13.31	10,392	15,636	26,028	52,056	52,056
2015	50	14.31	10,819	9,372	20,192	40,383	40,383
2016	51	15.31	10,884	8,424	19,308	38,616	38,616
2017	52	16.31	7,685	7,281	15,327	30,293	30,293
2018	53	17.31	793	841	1,634	3,267	3,267
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$168,464</b>	<b>\$258,981</b>	<b>\$402,806</b>	<b>\$830,251</b>	<b>\$830,251</b>

**Note:** Care services include a one-time \$25,000 for Samuel Jr. (with ADD)

# **Exhibit B-13**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Lamar Hulse**

December 11, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **May 8, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile



VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	4.2%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES  
MR. LAMAR HULSE**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$453,619
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	13,357
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$466,975</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
22,394	3.0%	8.500%	2,459	74.630%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. LAMAR HULSE**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	30	0.31	1.00000	\$6,867	\$754	\$0	(\$584)	(\$4,689)	\$2,348	\$2,348
2002	31	1.31	1.07201	24,007	2,636	(731)	(1,979)	(15,902)	8,031	8,031
2003	32	2.31	1.06997	25,687	2,820	(783)	(2,118)	(17,014)	8,592	8,592
2004	33	3.31	1.06794	27,432	3,012	(836)	(2,262)	(18,170)	9,176	9,176
2005	34	4.31	1.06591	29,240	3,211	(891)	(2,411)	(19,368)	9,781	9,781
2006	35	5.31	1.06388	31,108	3,416	(948)	(2,565)	(20,605)	10,406	10,406
2007	36	6.31	1.06185	33,032	3,627	(1,006)	(2,723)	(21,880)	11,049	11,049
2008	37	7.31	1.05983	35,008	3,844	(1,066)	(2,886)	(23,189)	11,710	11,710
2009	38	8.31	1.05781	37,032	4,066	(1,128)	(3,053)	(24,529)	12,387	12,387
2010	39	9.31	1.05580	39,098	4,293	(1,191)	(3,224)	(25,898)	13,079	13,079
2011	40	10.31	1.05379	41,202	4,524	(1,255)	(3,397)	(27,291)	13,782	13,782
2012	41	11.31	1.05179	43,335	4,758	(1,320)	(3,573)	(28,704)	14,496	14,496
2013	42	12.31	1.04979	45,493	4,995	(1,386)	(3,751)	(30,134)	15,218	15,218
2014	43	13.31	1.04779	47,667	5,234	(1,452)	(3,930)	(31,574)	15,945	15,945
2015	44	14.31	1.04579	49,850	5,474	(1,519)	(4,110)	(33,019)	16,675	16,675
2016	45	15.31	1.04380	52,033	5,713	(1,585)	(4,290)	(34,466)	17,406	17,406
2017	46	16.31	1.04182	54,209	5,952	(1,651)	(4,470)	(35,907)	18,133	18,133
2018	47	17.31	1.03984	56,369	6,189	(1,717)	(4,648)	(37,338)	18,856	18,856
2019	48	18.31	1.03786	58,503	6,424	(1,782)	(4,824)	(38,751)	19,570	19,570
2020	49	19.31	1.03588	60,602	6,654	(1,846)	(4,997)	(40,141)	20,272	19,826
2021	50	20.31	1.03391	62,657	6,880	(1,909)	(5,166)	(41,503)	20,959	19,672
2022	51	21.31	1.03194	64,658	7,100	(1,970)	(5,331)	(42,828)	21,629	19,483
2023	52	22.31	1.03000	66,598	7,313	(2,029)	(5,491)	(44,113)	22,278	19,258
2024	53	23.31	1.03000	68,596	7,532	(2,090)	(5,656)	(45,437)	22,946	19,036
2025	54	24.31	1.03000	70,654	7,758	(2,152)	(5,825)	(46,800)	23,634	18,817
2026	55	25.31	1.03000	72,774	7,991	(2,217)	(6,000)	(48,204)	24,343	18,601
2027	56	26.31	1.03000	74,957	8,230	(2,283)	(6,180)	(49,650)	25,074	18,386
2028	57	27.31	1.03000	77,205	8,477	(2,352)	(6,366)	(51,139)	25,826	18,175
2029	58	28.31	1.03000	79,522	8,732	(2,423)	(6,557)	(52,673)	26,601	17,965
2030	59	29.31	1.03000	81,907	8,993	(2,495)	(6,753)	(54,254)	27,399	17,758
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$1,517,302</b>	<b>\$166,600</b>	<b>(\$46,014)</b>	<b>(\$125,119)</b>	<b>(\$1,005,169)</b>	<b>\$507,600</b>	<b>\$453,619</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	74.630%	4.000%	0.000%

## EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS

MR. LAMAR HULSE

SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401(K)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	30	0.31	\$275	\$0	\$0	(\$205)	\$70	\$70
2002	31	1.31	960	0	0	(717)	244	244
2003	32	2.31	997	0	0	(744)	253	253
2004	33	3.31	1,064	0	0	(794)	270	270
2005	34	4.31	1,135	0	0	(847)	288	288
2006	35	5.31	1,207	0	0	(901)	306	306
2007	36	6.31	1,282	0	0	(956)	325	325
2008	37	7.31	1,358	0	0	(1,014)	345	345
2009	38	8.31	1,437	0	0	(1,072)	365	365
2010	39	9.31	1,517	0	0	(1,132)	385	385
2011	40	10.31	1,599	0	0	(1,193)	406	406
2012	41	11.31	1,681	0	0	(1,255)	427	427
2013	42	12.31	1,765	0	0	(1,317)	448	448
2014	43	13.31	1,849	0	0	(1,380)	469	469
2015	44	14.31	1,934	0	0	(1,443)	491	491
2016	45	15.31	2,019	0	0	(1,507)	512	512
2017	46	16.31	2,103	0	0	(1,570)	534	534
2018	47	17.31	2,187	0	0	(1,632)	555	555
2019	48	18.31	2,270	0	0	(1,694)	576	576
2020	49	19.31	2,351	0	0	(1,755)	597	583
2021	50	20.31	2,431	0	0	(1,814)	617	579
2022	51	21.31	2,509	0	0	(1,872)	636	573
2023	52	22.31	2,584	0	0	(1,928)	656	567
2024	53	23.31	2,662	0	0	(1,986)	675	560
2025	54	24.31	2,741	0	0	(2,046)	695	554
2026	55	25.31	2,824	0	0	(2,107)	716	547
2027	56	26.31	2,908	0	0	(2,170)	738	541
2028	57	27.31	2,996	0	0	(2,236)	760	535
2029	58	28.31	3,085	0	0	(2,303)	783	529
2030	59	29.31	3,178	0	0	(2,372)	806	523
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$58,908</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$43,963)</b>	<b>\$14,945</b>	<b>\$13,357</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MR. LAMAR HULSE**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	30	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	31	1.31			0	0
2003	32	2.31			0	0
2004	33	3.31			0	0
2005	34	4.31			0	0
2006	35	5.31			0	0
2007	36	6.31			0	0
2008	37	7.31			0	0
2009	38	8.31			0	0
2010	39	9.31			0	0
2011	40	10.31			0	0
2012	41	11.31			0	0
2013	42	12.31			0	0
2014	43	13.31			0	0
2015	44	14.31			0	0
2016	45	15.31			0	0
2017	46	16.31			0	0
2018	47	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-14**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mrs. Roberta Heber**

December 11, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **June 24, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

The amount awarded by **The Fund** was 29% higher than that set forth in their Valuation Model. The amount computed by the model was \$561,180.50, whereas the amount that **The Fund** awarded was \$724,173.50. In order to calculate the present value of economic loss, we converted the values in **The Fund**'s valuation model (i.e., wages, benefits...) to the amounts that could have produced the actual amount paid, assuming all else remained the same. These amounts were set equal to the model's amounts multiplied by 1.29 (or 724,173.50 divided by 561,180.50).

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund**'s report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund**'s analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.4%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MRS. ROBERTA HEBER**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$621,494
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	167,449
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$788,942</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
131,969	3.0%	21.600%	3,101	12.487%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MRS. ROBERTA HEBER**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	60	0.31	1.00000	\$40,467	\$951	\$0	(\$8,741)	(\$3,961)	\$28,716	\$28,716
2002	61	1.31	1.03000	135,929	3,194	(3,272)	(28,480)	(12,907)	94,464	94,464
2003	62	2.31	1.03000	140,006	3,290	(3,370)	(29,334)	(13,295)	97,298	97,298
2004	63	3.31	1.03000	144,207	3,389	(3,471)	(30,214)	(13,693)	100,216	100,216
2005	64	4.31	1.03000	148,533	3,491	(3,576)	(31,121)	(14,104)	103,223	103,223
2006	65	5.31	1.03000	152,989	3,595	(3,683)	(32,054)	(14,527)	106,320	106,320
2007	66	6.14	1.03000	131,315	3,086	(3,161)	(27,513)	(12,469)	91,258	91,258
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$893,446</b>	<b>\$20,996</b>	<b>(\$20,534)</b>	<b>(\$187,457)</b>	<b>(\$84,958)</b>	<b>\$621,494</b>	<b>\$621,494</b>

6.13997333



Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	401(k) Contrib. Rate	Pension Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	12.487%	5.766%	0.000%

## EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS

MRS. ROBERTA HEBER  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	401 (K)	VESTED PENSION	PROJECTED PENSION	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	60	0.31	\$2,333	\$0	\$0	(\$291)	\$2,042	\$2,042
2002	61	1.31	7,838	0	0	(979)	6,859	6,859
2003	62	2.31	7,831	0	0	(978)	6,853	6,853
2004	63	3.31	8,066	0	0	(1,007)	7,059	7,059
2005	64	4.31	8,308	0	0	(1,037)	7,271	7,271
2006	65	5.31	8,557	(5,309)	0	(406)	2,843	2,843
2007	66	6.31	7,345	(7,963)	3,034	(302)	2,114	2,114
2008	67	7.31	0	(7,963)	18,204	(1,279)	8,962	8,962
2009	68	8.31	0	(7,963)	18,204	(1,279)	8,962	8,962
2010	69	9.31	0	(7,963)	18,204	(1,279)	8,962	8,962
2011	70	10.31	0	(7,963)	18,204	(1,279)	8,962	8,962
2012	71	11.31	0	(7,963)	18,204	(1,279)	8,962	8,962
2013	72	12.31	0	(7,963)	18,204	(1,279)	8,962	8,962
2014	73	13.31	0	(7,963)	18,204	(1,279)	8,962	8,962
2015	74	14.31	0	(7,963)	18,204	(1,279)	8,962	8,962
2016	75	15.31	0	(7,963)	18,204	(1,279)	8,962	8,962
2017	76	16.31	0	(7,963)	18,204	(1,279)	8,962	8,962
2018	77	17.31	0	(7,963)	18,204	(1,279)	8,962	8,962
2019	78	18.31	0	(7,963)	18,204	(1,279)	8,962	8,962
2020	79	19.31	0	(7,963)	18,204	(1,279)	8,962	8,802
2021	80	20.31	0	(7,963)	18,204	(1,279)	8,962	8,512
2022	81	21.31	0	(7,299)	16,687	(1,172)	8,216	7,547
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$50,278</b>	<b>(\$132,053)</b>	<b>\$274,577</b>	<b>(\$24,074)</b>	<b>\$168,728</b>	<b>\$167,449</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MRS. ROBERTA HEBER**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	60	0.31	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
2002	61	1.31	0	0	0	0
2003	62	2.31	0	0	0	0
2004	63	3.31	0	0	0	0
2005	64	4.31	0	0	0	0
2006	65	5.31	0	0	0	0
2007	66	6.31	0	0	0	0
2008	67	7.31	0	0	0	0
2009	68	8.31	0	0	0	0
2010	69	9.31	0	0	0	0
2011	70	10.31	0	0	0	0
2012	71	11.31	0	0	0	0
2013	72	12.31	0	0	0	0
2014	73	13.31	0	0	0	0
2015	74	14.31	0	0	0	0
2016	75	15.31	0	0	0	0
2017	76	16.31	0	0	0	0
2018	77	17.31	0	0	0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-15**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mrs. Maxima Jean-Pierre**

December 11, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **May 16, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MRS. MAXIMA JEAN-PIERRE**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$559,356
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	16,532
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$575,888</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
20,317	3.0%	4.670%	4,768	30.651%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MRS. MAXIMA JEAN-PIERRE**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	41	0.31	1.00000	\$6,230	\$1,462	\$0	(\$291)	(\$433)	\$6,968	\$6,968
2002	42	1.31	1.04979	21,328	5,005	(753)	(966)	(1,440)	23,175	23,175
2003	43	2.31	1.04779	22,348	5,244	(789)	(1,012)	(1,508)	24,282	24,282
2004	44	3.31	1.04579	23,371	5,485	(825)	(1,059)	(1,864)	25,107	25,107
2005	45	4.31	1.04380	24,395	5,725	(861)	(1,105)	(3,058)	25,095	25,095
2006	46	5.31	1.04182	25,415	5,964	(897)	(1,151)	(4,460)	24,871	24,871
2007	47	6.31	1.03984	26,427	6,202	(933)	(1,197)	(4,638)	25,861	25,861
2008	48	7.31	1.03786	27,428	6,437	(968)	(1,242)	(7,774)	23,880	23,880
2009	49	8.31	1.03588	28,412	6,667	(1,003)	(1,287)	(8,053)	24,736	24,736
2010	50	9.31	1.03391	29,375	6,894	(1,037)	(1,331)	(8,326)	25,575	25,575
2011	51	10.31	1.03194	30,314	7,114	(1,070)	(1,373)	(8,592)	26,392	26,392
2012	52	11.31	1.03000	31,223	7,327	(1,103)	(1,414)	(8,850)	27,184	27,184
2013	53	12.31	1.03000	32,160	7,547	(1,136)	(1,457)	(9,115)	27,999	27,999
2014	54	13.31	1.03000	33,125	7,773	(1,170)	(1,501)	(9,389)	28,839	28,839
2015	55	14.31	1.03000	34,118	8,007	(1,205)	(1,546)	(9,670)	29,705	29,705
2016	56	15.31	1.03000	35,142	8,247	(1,241)	(1,592)	(9,960)	30,596	30,596
2017	57	16.31	1.03000	36,196	8,494	(1,278)	(1,640)	(10,259)	31,514	31,514
2018	58	17.31	1.03000	37,282	8,749	(1,316)	(1,689)	(10,567)	32,459	32,459
2019	59	18.31	1.03000	38,401	9,012	(1,356)	(1,740)	(10,884)	33,433	33,433
2020	60	19.31	1.03000	39,553	9,282	(1,397)	(1,792)	(11,210)	34,436	33,732
2021	61	20.14	1.03000	33,948	7,967	(1,199)	(1,538)	(9,622)	29,557	27,954
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$616,193</b>	<b>\$144,602</b>	<b>(\$21,538)</b>	<b>(\$27,922)</b>	<b>(\$149,672)</b>	<b>\$561,663</b>	<b>\$559,356</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	30.651%	4.000%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS****MRS. MAXIMA JEAN-PIERRE**

SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401(k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	41	0.31	\$249	\$0	\$0	(\$76)	\$173	\$173
2002	42	1.31	853	0	0	(261)	592	592
2003	43	2.31	867	0	0	(266)	601	601
2004	44	3.31	907	0	0	(278)	629	629
2005	45	4.31	947	0	0	(290)	656	656
2006	46	5.31	986	0	0	(302)	684	684
2007	47	6.31	1,025	0	0	(314)	711	711
2008	48	7.31	1,064	0	0	(326)	738	738
2009	49	8.31	1,102	0	0	(338)	764	764
2010	50	9.31	1,140	0	0	(349)	790	790
2011	51	10.31	1,176	0	0	(361)	816	816
2012	52	11.31	1,211	0	0	(371)	840	840
2013	53	12.31	1,248	0	0	(382)	865	865
2014	54	13.31	1,285	0	0	(394)	891	891
2015	55	14.31	1,324	0	0	(406)	918	918
2016	56	15.31	1,364	0	0	(418)	946	946
2017	57	16.31	1,404	0	0	(430)	974	974
2018	58	17.31	1,447	0	0	(443)	1,003	1,003
2019	59	18.31	1,490	0	0	(457)	1,033	1,033
2020	60	19.31	1,535	0	0	(470)	1,064	1,042
2021	61	20.14	1,317	0	0	(404)	913	864
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$23,941</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$7,338)</b>	<b>\$16,603</b>	<b>\$16,532</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MRS. MAXIMA JEAN-PIERRE**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	41	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	42	1.31			0	0
2003	43	2.31			0	0
2004	44	3.31			0	0
2005	45	4.31			0	0
2006	46	5.31			0	0
2007	47	6.31			0	0
2008	48	7.31			0	0
2009	49	8.31			0	0
2010	50	9.31			0	0
2011	51	10.31			0	0
2012	52	11.31			0	0
2013	53	12.31			0	0
2014	54	13.31			0	0
2015	55	14.31			0	0
2016	56	15.31			0	0
2017	57	16.31			0	0
2018	58	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>



# **Exhibit B-16**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Dennis Devlin**

December 10, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **February 25, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES  
MR. DENNIS DEVLIN**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$1,580,447
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	53,302
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	493,679
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$2,127,428</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
121,106	3.0%	21.600%	7,585	12.486%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. DENNIS DEVLIN**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	51	0.31	1.00000	\$37,136	\$2,326	\$0	(\$8,021)	(\$2,534)	\$28,907	\$28,907
2002	52	1.31	1.03000	124,739	7,813	(3,118)	(26,944)	(8,511)	93,980	93,980
2003	53	2.31	1.03000	128,482	8,047	(3,211)	(26,919)	(8,503)	97,895	97,895
2004	54	3.31	1.03000	132,336	8,289	(3,307)	(27,727)	(8,759)	100,832	100,832
2005	55	4.31	1.03000	136,306	8,537	(3,407)	(28,559)	(9,021)	103,857	103,857
2006	56	5.31	1.04182	142,006	8,895	(3,549)	(29,753)	(9,399)	108,200	108,200
2007	57	6.31	1.03984	147,664	9,249	(3,691)	(30,939)	(14,021)	108,262	108,262
2008	58	7.31	1.03786	153,254	9,599	(3,830)	(32,110)	(14,552)	112,361	112,361
2009	59	8.31	1.03588	158,753	9,943	(3,968)	(33,262)	(15,074)	116,393	116,393
2010	60	9.31	1.03391	164,137	10,281	(4,102)	(34,390)	(15,585)	120,340	120,340
2011	61	10.31	1.03194	169,379	10,609	(4,233)	(35,488)	(16,083)	124,183	124,183
2012	62	11.31	1.03000	174,460	10,927	(4,360)	(36,553)	(16,566)	127,909	127,909
2013	63	12.31	1.03000	179,694	11,255	(4,491)	(37,650)	(17,063)	131,746	131,746
2014	64	13.31	1.03000	185,085	11,593	(4,626)	(38,779)	(17,574)	135,698	135,698
2015	65	13.81	1.03000	95,319	5,970	(2,382)	(19,971)	(9,051)	69,885	69,885
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$2,128,751</b>	<b>\$133,334</b>	<b>(\$52,276)</b>	<b>(\$447,065)</b>	<b>(\$182,297)</b>	<b>\$1,580,447</b>	<b>\$1,580,447</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	21.600%	12.486%	4.000%	0.000%

## EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS

MR. DENNIS DEVLIN

SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401(k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	51	0.31	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
2002	52	1.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2003	53	2.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2004	54	3.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2005	55	4.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2006	56	5.31	5,510	0	0	(688)	4,822	4,822
2007	57	6.31	5,729	0	0	(715)	5,014	5,014
2008	58	7.31	5,946	0	0	(742)	5,204	5,204
2009	59	8.31	6,160	0	0	(769)	5,391	5,391
2010	60	9.31	6,368	0	0	(795)	5,573	5,573
2011	61	10.31	6,572	0	0	(821)	5,751	5,751
2012	62	11.31	6,769	0	0	(845)	5,924	5,924
2013	63	12.31	6,972	0	0	(871)	6,102	6,102
2014	64	13.31	7,181	0	0	(897)	6,285	6,285
2015	65	14.31	3,698	0	0	(462)	3,237	3,237
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$60,906</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$7,605)</b>	<b>\$53,302</b>	<b>\$53,302</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MR. DENNIS DEVLIN**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	51	0.31	\$6,208		\$6,208	\$6,208
2002	52	1.31	20,244		20,244	20,244
2003	53	2.31	20,244		20,244	20,244
2004	54	3.31	20,244		20,244	20,244
2005	55	4.31	20,244		20,244	20,244
2006	56	5.31	20,244		20,244	20,244
2007	57	6.31	20,244		20,244	20,244
2008	58	7.31	20,244		20,244	20,244
2009	59	8.31	20,244		20,244	20,244
2010	60	9.31	20,244		20,244	20,244
2011	61	10.31	20,244		20,244	20,244
2012	62	11.31	20,244		20,244	20,244
2013	63	12.31	20,244		20,244	20,244
2014	64	13.31	20,244		20,244	20,244
2015	65	14.31	20,244		20,244	20,244
2016	66	15.31	20,244		20,244	20,244
2017	67	16.31	20,244		20,244	20,244
2018	68	17.31	20,244		20,244	20,244
2019	69	18.31	20,244		20,244	20,244
2020	70	19.31	20,244		20,244	19,738
2021	71	20.31	20,244		20,244	18,834
2022	72	21.31	20,244		20,244	17,971
2023	73	22.31	20,244		20,244	17,148
2024	74	23.31	20,244		20,244	16,363
2025	75	24.31	20,244		20,244	15,614
2026	76	25.31	20,244		20,244	14,898
2027	77	25.48	3,509		3,509	2,512
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$515,817</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$515,817</b>	<b>\$493,679</b>

# **Exhibit B-17**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Stephen Fogel**

January 4, 2020

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **December 2, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,



John E. Beauzile



<b>Valuation Date</b>	01-Jan-20
<b>Discount Rate</b>	3.9%

**Exhibit 1. Summary of Economic Damages**  
**Mr. Stephen Fogel**

	<b><u>Present Value</u></b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$4,676,465
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	224,168
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	<u>0</u>
<b>Total</b>	<b><u><u>\$4,900,633</u></u></b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
235,070	3.0%	30.390%	3,395	6.68-12.49%

**Exhibit 2a. Present Value of Lost Earnings**  
**Mr. Stephen Fogel**  
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Age-Specific Growth Factor	Earnings	Benefits	Unempl. Adj.	Taxes	Consumption	Net Earnings	PV of Net Earnings
2001	40	0.31	1.00000	\$72,082	\$1,041	\$0	(\$21,906)	(\$3,351)	\$47,866	\$47,866
2002	41	1.31	1.05179	247,244	3,571	(5,238)	(72,883)	(11,150)	161,544	161,544
2003	42	2.31	1.04979	259,553	3,748	(5,499)	(76,512)	(11,705)	169,586	169,586
2004	43	3.31	1.04779	271,957	3,928	(5,761)	(80,168)	(12,264)	177,691	177,691
2005	44	4.31	1.04579	284,411	4,107	(6,025)	(83,840)	(12,826)	185,828	185,828
2006	45	5.31	1.04380	296,869	4,287	(6,289)	(87,512)	(13,388)	193,968	193,968
2007	46	6.31	1.04182	309,284	4,467	(6,552)	(91,172)	(13,948)	202,079	202,079
2008	47	7.31	1.03984	321,604	4,645	(6,813)	(94,803)	(14,503)	210,129	210,129
2009	48	8.31	1.03786	333,779	4,820	(7,071)	(98,392)	(15,052)	218,084	218,084
2010	49	9.31	1.03588	345,755	4,993	(7,325)	(101,923)	(15,592)	225,909	225,909
2011	50	10.31	1.03391	357,480	5,163	(7,573)	(105,379)	(16,121)	233,570	233,570
2012	51	11.31	1.03194	368,899	5,328	(7,815)	(108,745)	(16,677)	235,989	235,989
2013	52	12.31	1.03000	379,966	5,487	(8,049)	(112,007)	(17,228)	243,069	243,069
2014	53	13.31	1.03000	391,365	5,652	(8,291)	(115,368)	(17,797)	250,361	250,361
2015	54	14.31	1.03000	403,106	5,822	(8,540)	(118,829)	(18,386)	247,573	247,573
2016	55	15.31	1.03000	415,199	5,996	(8,796)	(122,394)	(18,996)	255,000	255,000
2017	56	16.31	1.03000	427,655	6,176	(9,060)	(126,065)	(19,633)	262,650	262,650
2018	57	17.31	1.03000	440,485	6,361	(9,331)	(129,847)	(20,298)	270,530	270,530
2019	58	18.31	1.03000	453,699	6,552	(9,611)	(133,743)	(20,993)	278,645	278,645
2020	59	19.31	1.03000	467,310	6,749	(9,900)	(137,755)	(21,728)	287,005	287,005
2021	60	20.31	1.03000	481,329	6,951	(10,197)	(141,888)	(22,503)	295,615	295,615
2022	61	20.47	1.03000	82,231	1,188	(1,742)	(24,240)	(6,933)	50,503	46,560
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$7,411,262</b>	<b>\$107,033</b>	<b>(\$155,478)</b>	<b>(\$2,185,371)</b>	<b>(\$474,253)</b>	<b>\$4,703,192</b>	<b>\$4,676,465</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	30.390%	6.68-12.49%	3.463%	0.000%

**Exhibit 3a. Present Value of Lost Pension Benefits**  
**Mr. Stephen Fogel**  
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Pension Contrib.	Net Pension (Projected-Vested)	Taxes	Consumption	Net Loss	PV of Net Loss
2001	40	0.31	\$2,496	\$0	\$0	(\$167)	\$2,330	\$2,330
2002	41	1.31	8,306	0	0	(555)	7,751	7,751
2003	42	2.31	8,719	0	0	(582)	8,137	8,137
2004	43	3.31	9,136	0	0	(610)	8,526	8,526
2005	44	4.31	9,554	0	0	(638)	8,916	8,916
2006	45	5.31	9,973	0	0	(666)	9,307	9,307
2007	46	6.31	10,390	0	0	(694)	9,696	9,696
2008	47	7.31	10,804	0	0	(722)	10,082	10,082
2009	48	8.31	11,213	0	0	(749)	10,464	10,464
2010	49	9.31	11,615	0	0	(776)	10,839	10,839
2011	50	10.31	12,009	0	0	(802)	11,207	11,207
2012	51	11.31	12,392	0	0	(1,078)	11,314	11,314
2013	52	12.31	12,764	0	0	(1,111)	11,653	11,653
2014	53	13.31	13,147	0	0	(1,144)	12,003	12,003
2015	54	14.31	13,542	0	0	(1,691)	11,851	11,851
2016	55	15.31	13,948	0	0	(1,742)	12,206	12,206
2017	56	16.31	14,366	0	0	(1,794)	12,572	12,572
2018	57	17.31	14,797	0	0	(1,848)	12,950	12,950
2019	58	18.31	15,241	0	0	(1,903)	13,338	13,338
2020	59	19.31	15,698	0	0	(1,960)	13,738	13,457
2021	60	20.31	16,169	0	0	(2,019)	14,150	13,341
2022	61	20.47	2,762	0	0	(345)	2,417	2,229
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$249,042</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$23,595)</b>	<b>\$225,447</b>	<b>\$224,168</b>

**Exhibit 4a. Loss Estimated Value of Replacement Services**  
**Mr. Stephen Fogel**

<b>Year</b>	<b>Age</b>	<b>Time Frame</b>	<b>Household Services</b>	<b>Care Services</b>	<b>Total Services</b>	<b>Present Value</b>
2001	40	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	41	1.31			0	0
2003	42	2.31			0	0
2004	43	3.31			0	0
2005	44	4.31			0	0
2006	45	5.31			0	0
2007	46	6.31			0	0
2008	47	7.31			0	0
2009	48	8.31			0	0
2010	49	9.31			0	0
2011	50	10.31			0	0
2012	51	11.31			0	0
2013	52	12.31			0	0
2014	53	13.31			0	0
2015	54	14.31			0	0
2016	55	15.31			0	0
2017	56	16.31			0	0
2018	57	17.31			0	0
2019	58	18.31			0	0
2020	59	19.31			0	0
2021	60	20.31			0	0
2022	61	21.31			0	0
2023	62	22.31			0	0
2024	63	23.31			0	0
2025	64	24.31			0	0
2026	65	25.31			0	0
2027	66	26.31			0	0
2028	67	27.31			0	0
2029	68	28.31			0	0
2030	69	29.31			0	0
2031	70	30.31			0	0
2032	71	31.31			0	0
2033	72	32.31			0	0
2034	73	33.31			0	0
2035	74	34.31			0	0
2036	75	35.06			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-18**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Charles Houston**

December 11, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **January 13, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MR. CHARLES HOUSTON**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$3,158,500
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	178,074
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	177,248
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$3,513,822</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
178,760	3.0%	27.700%	7,817	12.487%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. CHARLES HOUSTON**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	43	0.31	1.00000	\$54,815	\$2,397	\$0	(\$15,184)	(\$4,949)	\$37,080	\$37,080
2002	44	1.31	1.04579	186,946	8,175	(4,232)	(50,231)	(16,371)	124,288	124,288
2003	45	2.31	1.04380	195,135	8,533	(4,418)	(52,431)	(17,088)	129,732	129,732
2004	46	3.31	1.04182	203,295	8,890	(4,602)	(54,623)	(17,802)	135,157	135,157
2005	47	4.31	1.03984	211,394	9,244	(4,786)	(56,799)	(18,512)	140,541	140,541
2006	48	5.31	1.03786	219,396	9,594	(4,967)	(58,950)	(19,212)	145,862	145,862
2007	49	6.31	1.03588	227,269	9,938	(5,145)	(61,065)	(19,902)	151,095	151,095
2008	50	7.31	1.03391	234,975	10,275	(5,319)	(63,136)	(20,577)	156,219	156,219
2009	51	8.31	1.03194	242,481	10,603	(5,489)	(65,152)	(21,234)	161,209	161,209
2010	52	9.31	1.03000	249,756	10,922	(5,654)	(67,107)	(21,871)	166,045	166,045
2011	53	10.31	1.03000	257,248	11,249	(5,824)	(69,120)	(22,527)	171,027	171,027
2012	54	11.31	1.03000	264,966	11,587	(5,998)	(71,194)	(23,203)	176,157	176,157
2013	55	12.31	1.03000	272,915	11,934	(6,178)	(73,329)	(23,899)	181,442	181,442
2014	56	13.31	1.03000	281,102	12,292	(6,364)	(75,529)	(24,616)	186,885	186,885
2015	57	14.31	1.03000	289,535	12,661	(6,555)	(77,795)	(25,354)	192,492	192,492
2016	58	15.31	1.03000	298,221	13,041	(6,751)	(80,129)	(26,115)	198,267	198,267
2017	59	16.31	1.03000	307,168	13,432	(6,954)	(82,533)	(26,898)	204,215	204,215
2018	60	17.31	1.03000	316,383	13,835	(7,162)	(85,009)	(27,705)	210,341	210,341
2019	61	18.31	1.03000	325,874	14,250	(7,377)	(87,559)	(28,537)	216,651	216,651
2020	62	18.64	1.03000	111,884	4,893	(2,533)	(30,062)	(9,798)	74,384	73,794
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$4,750,758</b>	<b>\$207,745</b>	<b>(\$106,309)</b>	<b>(\$1,276,937)</b>	<b>(\$416,168)</b>	<b>\$3,159,090</b>	<b>\$3,158,500</b>



Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	12.487%	4.000%	0.411%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MR. CHARLES HOUSTON**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401(k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	43	0.31	\$2,193	\$225	\$0	(\$302)	\$2,116	\$2,116
2002	44	1.31	7,478	768	0	(1,030)	7,216	7,216
2003	45	2.31	7,571	778	0	(1,042)	7,306	7,306
2004	46	3.31	7,888	810	0	(1,086)	7,612	7,612
2005	47	4.31	8,202	842	0	(1,129)	7,915	7,915
2006	48	5.31	8,513	874	0	(1,172)	8,215	8,215
2007	49	6.31	8,818	906	0	(1,214)	8,509	8,509
2008	50	7.31	9,117	936	0	(1,255)	8,798	8,798
2009	51	8.31	9,408	966	0	(1,295)	9,079	9,079
2010	52	9.31	9,691	995	0	(1,334)	9,351	9,351
2011	53	10.31	9,981	1,025	0	(1,374)	9,632	9,632
2012	54	11.31	10,281	1,056	0	(1,416)	9,921	9,921
2013	55	12.31	10,589	1,087	0	(1,458)	10,219	10,219
2014	56	13.31	10,907	1,120	0	(1,502)	10,525	10,525
2015	57	14.31	11,234	1,154	0	(1,547)	10,841	10,841
2016	58	15.31	11,571	1,188	0	(1,593)	11,166	11,166
2017	59	16.31	11,918	1,224	0	(1,641)	11,501	11,501
2018	60	17.31	12,276	1,261	0	(1,690)	11,846	11,846
2019	61	18.31	12,644	1,299	0	(1,741)	12,202	12,202
2020	62	19.31	4,341	446	0	(598)	4,189	4,104
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$184,620</b>	<b>\$18,960</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$25,420)</b>	<b>\$178,160</b>	<b>\$178,074</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MR. CHARLES HOUSTON**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	OUT-OF-POCKET LABOR COSTS	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	43	0.31		\$13,800	\$13,800	\$13,800
2002	44	1.31			0	0
2003	45	2.31	4,714		4,714	4,714
2004	46	3.31	9,720		9,720	9,720
2005	47	4.31	9,720		9,720	9,720
2006	48	5.31	9,720		9,720	9,720
2007	49	6.31	9,720		9,720	9,720
2008	50	7.31	9,720		9,720	9,720
2009	51	8.31	9,720		9,720	9,720
2010	52	9.31	9,720		9,720	9,720
2011	53	10.31	9,720		9,720	9,720
2012	54	11.31	9,720		9,720	9,720
2013	55	12.31	9,720		9,720	9,720
2014	56	13.31	9,720		9,720	9,720
2015	57	14.31	9,720		9,720	9,720
2016	58	15.31	9,720		9,720	9,720
2017	59	16.31	9,720		9,720	9,720
2018	60	17.31	9,720		9,720	9,720
2019	61	18.31	9,720		9,720	9,720
2020	62	18.64	3,240		3,240	3,214
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$163,474</b>	<b>\$13,800</b>	<b>\$177,274</b>	<b>\$177,248</b>

# **Exhibit B-19**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Nezam Ahmad Emran Hafiz**

January 2, 2020

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **March 17, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,



John E. Beauzile

<b>Valuation Date</b>	01-Jan-20
<b>Discount Rate</b>	4.2%

**Exhibit 1. Summary of Economic Damages**  
**Nezam Ahmad Emran Hafiz**

	<b><u>Present Value</u></b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$1,744,521
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	110,082
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	244,457
<b>Total</b>	<b><u><u>\$2,099,060</u></u></b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
49,211	3.0%	15.410%	2,717	12.95-63.54%

**Exhibit 2a. Present Value of Lost Earnings**  
**Nezam Ahmad Emran Hafiz**  
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Age-Specific Growth Factor	Earnings	Benefits	Unempl. Adj.	Taxes	Consumption	Net Earnings	PV of Net Earnings
2001	32	0.31	1.00000	\$15,090	\$833	\$0	(\$2,325)	(\$1,653)	\$11,945	\$11,945
2002	33	1.31	1.06794	52,554	2,901	(1,407)	(7,856)	(5,584)	40,609	40,609
2003	34	2.31	1.06591	56,018	3,092	(1,500)	(8,373)	(5,952)	43,285	43,285
2004	35	3.31	1.06388	59,596	3,290	(1,596)	(8,908)	(6,332)	46,050	46,050
2005	36	4.31	1.06185	63,282	3,493	(1,695)	(9,459)	(6,724)	48,898	48,898
2006	37	5.31	1.05983	67,068	3,702	(1,796)	(10,025)	(7,126)	51,824	51,824
2007	38	6.31	1.05781	70,946	3,916	(1,900)	(10,605)	(7,538)	54,820	54,820
2008	39	7.31	1.05580	74,905	4,135	(2,006)	(11,197)	(7,958)	57,879	57,879
2009	40	8.31	1.05379	78,934	4,357	(2,114)	(11,799)	(8,386)	60,992	60,992
2010	41	9.31	1.05179	83,022	4,583	(2,223)	(12,410)	(8,821)	64,151	64,151
2011	42	10.31	1.04979	87,155	4,811	(2,334)	(13,028)	(9,260)	67,345	67,345
2012	43	11.31	1.04779	91,320	5,041	(2,445)	(13,650)	(9,702)	70,563	70,563
2013	44	12.31	1.04579	95,502	5,272	(2,557)	(14,275)	(10,147)	73,794	73,794
2014	45	13.31	1.04380	99,685	5,503	(2,669)	(14,901)	(10,591)	77,027	77,027
2015	46	14.31	1.04182	103,854	5,733	(2,781)	(15,524)	(11,034)	80,248	80,248
2016	47	15.31	1.03984	107,991	5,961	(2,892)	(16,142)	(11,474)	83,445	83,445
2017	48	16.31	1.03786	112,079	6,187	(3,001)	(16,753)	(11,908)	86,624	86,624
2018	49	17.31	1.03588	116,101	6,409	(3,109)	(17,354)	(12,400)	89,797	89,797
2019	50	18.31	1.03391	120,038	6,626	(3,214)	(17,943)	(12,903)	92,869	92,869
2020	51	19.31	1.03194	123,872	6,838	(3,317)	(18,516)	(13,421)	95,923	95,923
2021	52	20.31	1.03000	127,588	7,043	(3,417)	(19,072)	(13,954)	98,957	98,957
2022	53	21.31	1.03000	131,416	7,254	(3,519)	(19,644)	(14,503)	101,953	101,953
2023	54	22.31	1.03000	135,358	7,472	(3,625)	(20,233)	(15,067)	104,913	104,913
2024	55	23.31	1.03000	139,419	7,696	(3,733)	(20,840)	(15,641)	107,842	107,842
2025	56	24.31	1.03000	143,602	7,927	(3,845)	(21,465)	(16,225)	110,732	110,732
2026	57	25.31	1.03000	147,910	8,165	(3,961)	(22,109)	(16,819)	113,580	113,580
2027	58	26.31	1.03000	152,347	8,410	(4,080)	(22,772)	(17,432)	116,385	116,385
2028	59	27.31	1.03000	156,917	8,662	(4,202)	(23,456)	(18,064)	119,149	119,149
2029	60	27.64	1.03000	53,876	2,974	(1,443)	(8,053)	(28,090)	19,264	13,189
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$2,867,445</b>	<b>\$158,289</b>	<b>(\$76,380)</b>	<b>(\$428,687)</b>	<b>(\$677,149)</b>	<b>\$1,843,518</b>	<b>\$1,744,521</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	15.410%	12.95-63.54%	0.000%	0.000%

**Exhibit 3a. Present Value of Lost Pension Benefits**  
**Nezam Ahmad Emran Hafiz**  
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Pension Contrib.	Net Pension (Projected-Vested)	Taxes	Consumption	Net Loss	PV of Net Loss
2001	32	0.31	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
2002	33	1.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2003	34	2.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2004	35	3.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2005	36	4.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2006	37	5.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2007	38	6.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2008	39	7.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2009	40	8.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2010	41	9.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2011	42	10.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2012	43	11.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2013	44	12.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2014	45	13.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2015	46	14.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2016	47	15.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2017	48	16.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2018	49	17.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2019	50	18.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2020	51	19.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2021	52	20.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2022	53	21.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2023	54	22.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2024	55	23.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2025	56	24.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2026	57	25.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2027	58	26.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2028	59	27.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2029	60	28.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2030	61	29.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2031	62	30.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2032	63	31.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2033	64	32.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2034	65	33.31	0	41,872	(6,452)	(22,506)	12,913	7,100
2035	66	34.31	0	62,808	(9,679)	(33,760)	19,370	10,220
2036	67	35.31	0	62,808	(9,679)	(33,760)	19,370	9,808
2037	68	36.31	0	62,808	(9,679)	(33,760)	19,370	9,413
2038	69	37.31	0	62,808	(9,679)	(33,760)	19,370	9,033
2039	70	38.31	0	62,808	(9,679)	(33,760)	19,370	8,669
2040	71	39.31	0	62,808	(9,679)	(33,760)	19,370	8,320
2041	72	40.31	0	62,808	(9,679)	(33,760)	19,370	7,985
2042	73	41.31	0	62,808	(9,679)	(33,760)	19,370	7,663
2043	74	42.31	0	62,808	(9,679)	(33,760)	19,370	7,354
2044	75	43.31	0	62,808	(9,679)	(33,760)	19,370	7,057
2045	76	44.31	0	62,808	(9,679)	(33,760)	19,370	6,773
2046	77	45.31	0	62,808	(9,679)	(33,760)	19,370	6,500
2047	78	45.97	0	41,872	(6,452)	(22,506)	12,913	4,187
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$837,440</b>	<b>(\$129,050)</b>	<b>(\$450,130)</b>	<b>\$258,261</b>	<b>\$110,082</b>

**Exhibit 4a. Loss Estimated Value of Replacement Services**  
**Nezam Ahmad Emran Hafiz**

<b>Year</b>	<b>Age</b>	<b>Time Frame</b>	<b>Household Services</b>	<b>Care Services</b>	<b>Total Services</b>	<b>Present Value</b>
2001	32	0.31	\$2,749	\$431	\$3,179	\$3,179
2002	33	1.31	9,233	1,446	10,679	10,679
2003	34	2.31	9,510	1,490	10,999	10,999
2004	35	3.31	9,795	1,534	11,329	11,329
2005	36	4.31	10,089	1,580	11,669	11,669
2006	37	5.31	10,392	1,628	12,019	12,019
2007	38	6.31	10,703	1,676	12,380	12,380
2008	39	7.31	11,025	1,727	12,751	12,751
2009	40	8.31	11,355	1,779	13,134	13,134
2010	41	9.31	11,696	1,832	13,528	13,528
2011	42	10.31	12,047	1,887	13,934	13,934
2012	43	11.31	12,408	1,943	14,352	14,352
2013	44	12.31	12,781	2,002	14,782	14,782
2014	45	13.31	13,164	2,062	15,226	15,226
2015	46	14.31	13,559	2,124	15,683	15,683
2016	47	15.31	13,966	2,187	16,153	16,153
2017	48	16.31	14,385	2,253	16,638	16,638
2018	49	17.31	14,816	2,321	17,137	17,137
2019	50	17.81	7,682	1,203	8,885	8,885
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$211,353</b>	<b>\$33,104</b>	<b>\$244,457</b>	<b>\$244,457</b>



# **Exhibit B-20**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Luke Albert Dudek**

December 10, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **May 19, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MR. LUKE A. DUDEK**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$647,651
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	28,673
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	121,517
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$797,841</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
59,441	3.0%	16.100%	2,426	16.264%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. LUKE A. DUDEK**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	51	0.31	1.00000	\$18,227	\$926	\$0	(\$2,935)	(\$2,487)	\$13,732	\$13,732
2002	52	1.31	1.03000	61,224	3,111	(1,619)	(9,561)	(8,354)	44,801	44,801
2003	53	2.31	1.03000	63,061	3,205	(1,668)	(9,848)	(8,347)	46,403	46,403
2004	54	3.31	1.03000	64,953	3,301	(1,718)	(10,144)	(8,597)	47,795	47,795
2005	55	4.31	1.03000	66,901	3,400	(1,769)	(10,448)	(8,855)	49,229	49,229
2006	56	5.31	1.03000	68,908	3,502	(1,823)	(10,761)	(9,121)	50,705	50,705
2007	57	6.31	1.03000	70,976	3,607	(1,877)	(11,084)	(9,394)	52,227	52,227
2008	58	7.31	1.03000	73,105	3,715	(1,934)	(11,417)	(9,676)	53,793	53,793
2009	59	8.31	1.03000	75,298	3,827	(1,992)	(11,759)	(9,967)	55,407	55,407
2010	60	9.31	1.03000	77,557	3,941	(2,051)	(12,112)	(10,266)	57,069	57,069
2011	61	10.31	1.03000	79,884	4,060	(2,113)	(12,475)	(10,574)	58,782	58,782
2012	62	11.31	1.03000	82,280	4,181	(2,176)	(12,850)	(10,891)	60,545	60,545
2013	63	12.22	1.03000	77,686	3,948	(2,055)	(12,132)	(10,283)	57,164	57,164
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$880,061</b>	<b>\$44,723</b>	<b>(\$22,795)</b>	<b>(\$137,527)</b>	<b>(\$116,811)</b>	<b>\$647,651</b>	<b>\$647,651</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	16.100%	16.264%	4.000%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS****MR. LUKE A. DUDEK**

SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401(K)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	51	0.31	\$729	\$0	\$0	(\$119)	\$611	\$611
2002	52	1.31	2,449	0	0	(398)	2,051	2,051
2003	53	2.31	2,447	0	0	(398)	2,049	2,049
2004	54	3.31	2,520	0	0	(410)	2,110	2,110
2005	55	4.31	2,596	0	0	(422)	2,174	2,174
2006	56	5.31	2,674	0	0	(435)	2,239	2,239
2007	57	6.31	2,754	0	0	(448)	2,306	2,306
2008	58	7.31	2,836	0	0	(461)	2,375	2,375
2009	59	8.31	2,922	0	0	(475)	2,446	2,446
2010	60	9.31	3,009	0	0	(489)	2,520	2,520
2011	61	10.31	3,099	0	0	(504)	2,595	2,595
2012	62	11.31	3,192	0	0	(519)	2,673	2,673
2013	63	12.22	3,014	0	0	(490)	2,524	2,524
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$34,242</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$5,569)</b>	<b>\$28,673</b>	<b>\$28,673</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MR. LUKE A. DUDEK**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	51	0.31	\$3,047		\$3,047	\$3,047
2002	52	1.31	9,936		9,936	9,936
2003	53	2.31	9,936		9,936	9,936
2004	54	3.31	9,936		9,936	9,936
2005	55	4.31	9,936		9,936	9,936
2006	56	5.31	9,936		9,936	9,936
2007	57	6.31	9,936		9,936	9,936
2008	58	7.31	9,936		9,936	9,936
2009	59	8.31	9,936		9,936	9,936
2010	60	9.31	9,936		9,936	9,936
2011	61	10.31	9,936		9,936	9,936
2012	62	11.31	9,936		9,936	9,936
2013	63	12.23	9,175		9,175	9,175
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$121,517</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$121,517</b>	<b>\$121,517</b>

# **Exhibit B-21**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mrs. Tamitha Freeman**

December 11, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **May 11, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile



VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MRS. TAMITHA FREEMAN**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$1,800,930
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	80,682
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	565,337
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$2,446,949</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
40,833	3.0%	14.720%	2,449	19.673%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MRS. TAMITHA FREEMAN**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	35	0.31	1.00000	\$12,521	\$751	\$0	(\$1,843)	(\$1,444)	\$9,985	\$9,985
2002	36	1.31	1.06185	43,359	2,601	(1,176)	(6,191)	(4,851)	33,741	33,741
2003	37	2.31	1.05983	45,953	2,756	(1,246)	(6,561)	(5,141)	35,760	35,760
2004	38	3.31	1.05781	48,609	2,916	(1,318)	(6,941)	(5,438)	37,828	37,828
2005	39	4.31	1.05580	51,322	3,078	(1,392)	(7,328)	(5,742)	39,939	39,939
2006	40	5.31	1.05379	54,083	3,244	(1,467)	(7,722)	(6,051)	42,087	42,087
2007	41	6.31	1.05179	56,883	3,412	(1,543)	(8,122)	(6,364)	44,267	44,267
2008	42	7.31	1.04979	59,715	3,582	(1,619)	(8,526)	(6,681)	46,470	46,470
2009	43	8.31	1.04779	62,569	3,753	(1,697)	(8,934)	(7,000)	48,691	48,691
2010	44	9.31	1.04579	65,434	3,925	(1,774)	(9,343)	(7,321)	50,921	50,921
2011	45	10.31	1.04380	68,301	4,097	(1,852)	(9,752)	(7,641)	53,151	53,151
2012	46	11.31	1.04182	71,157	4,268	(1,930)	(10,160)	(7,961)	55,374	55,374
2013	47	12.31	1.03984	73,992	4,438	(2,007)	(10,565)	(8,278)	57,580	57,580
2014	48	13.31	1.03786	76,793	4,606	(2,082)	(10,965)	(8,592)	59,760	59,760
2015	49	14.31	1.03588	79,548	4,771	(2,157)	(11,358)	(8,900)	61,904	61,904
2016	50	15.31	1.03391	82,245	4,933	(2,230)	(11,743)	(9,202)	64,003	64,003
2017	51	16.31	1.03194	84,873	5,091	(2,302)	(12,118)	(9,496)	66,048	66,048
2018	52	17.31	1.03000	87,419	5,243	(2,371)	(12,482)	(9,780)	68,029	68,029
2019	53	18.31	1.03000	90,041	5,401	(2,442)	(12,856)	(10,074)	70,070	70,070
2020	54	19.31	1.03000	92,743	5,563	(2,515)	(13,242)	(10,362)	72,004	72,004
2021	55	20.31	1.03000	95,525	5,730	(2,590)	(13,639)	(10,655)	73,886	73,886
2022	56	21.31	1.03000	98,391	5,901	(2,668)	(14,049)	(10,952)	75,710	75,710
2023	57	22.31	1.03000	101,342	6,078	(2,748)	(14,470)	(11,253)	77,522	77,522
2024	58	23.31	1.03000	104,383	6,261	(2,831)	(14,904)	(11,558)	79,270	79,270
2025	59	24.31	1.03000	107,514	6,449	(2,916)	(15,351)	(11,867)	80,996	80,996
2026	60	25.31	1.03000	110,740	6,642	(3,003)	(15,812)	(12,180)	82,667	82,667
2027	61	26.31	1.03000	114,062	6,841	(3,093)	(16,286)	(12,500)	84,273	84,273
2028	62	27.31	1.03000	117,484	7,047	(3,186)	(16,775)	(12,825)	85,811	85,811
2029	63	28.31	1.03000	121,008	7,258	(3,282)	(17,278)	(13,165)	87,281	87,281
2030	64	29.31	1.03000	124,638	7,476	(3,380)	(17,796)	(13,510)	88,682	88,682
2031	65	30.31	1.03000	128,377	7,700	(3,481)	(18,330)	(13,860)	89,996	89,996
2032	66	31.31	1.03000	132,229	7,931	(3,586)	(18,880)	(14,215)	91,214	91,214
2033	67	31.97	1.03000	90,797	5,446	(2,462)	(12,964)	(14,776)	66,041	39,590
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$2,754,049</b>	<b>\$165,186</b>	<b>(\$74,346)</b>	<b>(\$393,289)</b>	<b>(\$386,444)</b>	<b>\$2,065,155</b>	<b>\$1,800,930</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	19.673%	4.477%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MRS. TAMITHA FREEMAN**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401(K)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	35	0.31	\$561	\$0	\$0	(\$110)	\$450	\$450
2002	36	1.31	1,941	0	0	(382)	1,559	1,559
2003	37	2.31	1,996	0	0	(393)	1,603	1,603
2004	38	3.31	2,111	0	0	(415)	1,696	1,696
2005	39	4.31	2,229	0	0	(438)	1,790	1,790
2006	40	5.31	2,349	0	0	(462)	1,887	1,887
2007	41	6.31	2,470	0	0	(486)	1,984	1,984
2008	42	7.31	2,593	0	0	(510)	2,083	2,083
2009	43	8.31	2,717	0	0	(535)	2,183	2,183
2010	44	9.31	2,842	0	0	(559)	2,283	2,283
2011	45	10.31	2,966	0	0	(584)	2,383	2,383
2012	46	11.31	3,090	0	0	(608)	2,482	2,482
2013	47	12.31	3,213	0	0	(632)	2,581	2,581
2014	48	13.31	3,335	0	0	(656)	2,679	2,679
2015	49	14.31	3,455	0	0	(680)	2,775	2,775
2016	50	15.31	3,572	0	0	(703)	2,869	2,869
2017	51	16.31	3,686	0	0	(725)	2,961	2,961
2018	52	17.31	3,796	0	0	(747)	3,050	3,050
2019	53	18.31	3,910	0	0	(769)	3,141	3,141
2020	54	19.31	4,028	0	0	(792)	3,235	3,169
2021	55	20.31	4,149	0	0	(816)	3,332	3,142
2022	56	21.31	4,273	0	0	(841)	3,432	3,115
2023	57	22.31	4,401	0	0	(866)	3,535	3,088
2024	58	23.31	4,533	0	0	(892)	3,641	3,061
2025	59	24.31	4,669	0	0	(919)	3,751	3,034
2026	60	25.31	4,809	0	0	(946)	3,863	3,008
2027	61	26.31	4,954	0	0	(974)	3,979	2,982
2028	62	27.31	5,102	0	0	(1,004)	4,098	2,956
2029	63	28.31	5,255	0	0	(1,034)	4,221	2,931
2030	64	29.31	5,413	0	0	(1,065)	4,348	2,905
2031	65	30.31	5,575	0	0	(1,097)	4,478	2,880
2032	66	30.97	3,943	0	0	(776)	3,167	1,973
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$113,938</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$22,414)</b>	<b>\$91,523</b>	<b>\$80,682</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MRS. TAMITHA FREEMAN**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	ADDITIONAL AWARD	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	35	0.31	\$2,145	\$10,366	\$100,000	\$112,511	\$112,511
2002	36	1.31	6,996	33,804		40,800	40,800
2003	37	2.31	6,996	33,804		40,800	40,800
2004	38	3.31	6,996	33,804		40,800	40,800
2005	39	4.31	9,973	18,393		28,366	28,366
2006	40	5.31	10,512	15,600		26,112	26,112
2007	41	6.31	10,512	15,600		26,112	26,112
2008	42	7.31	10,512	15,600		26,112	26,112
2009	43	8.31	10,512	15,600		26,112	26,112
2010	44	9.31	10,512	15,600		26,112	26,112
2011	45	10.31	10,512	15,600		26,112	26,112
2012	46	11.31	10,512	15,600		26,112	26,112
2013	47	12.31	10,512	15,600		26,112	26,112
2014	48	13.31	13,489	5,614		19,102	19,102
2015	49	14.31	14,028	3,804		17,832	17,832
2016	50	15.31	14,028	3,804		17,832	17,832
2017	51	16.31	14,028	3,804		17,832	17,832
2018	52	17.31	14,028	3,804		17,832	17,832
2019	53	17.46	2,151	583		2,735	2,735
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$188,954</b>	<b>\$276,384</b>	<b>\$100,000</b>	<b>\$565,337</b>	<b>\$565,337</b>

# **Exhibit B-22**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mrs. Alva Cynthia Sanchez**

December 13, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **May 26, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MRS. ALVA CYNTHIA SANCHEZ**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$709,725
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	114,732
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$824,457</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
54,275	3.0%	16.100%	5,198	62.640%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MRS. ALVA CYNTHIA SANCHEZ**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	41	0.31	1.00000	\$16,643	\$1,594	\$0	(\$2,680)	(\$2,550)	\$13,008	\$13,008
2002	42	1.31	1.04979	56,978	5,457	(1,571)	(8,898)	(8,467)	43,498	43,498
2003	43	2.31	1.04779	59,700	5,718	(1,647)	(9,323)	(8,872)	45,576	45,576
2004	44	3.31	1.04579	62,434	5,980	(1,722)	(9,750)	(9,278)	47,664	47,664
2005	45	4.31	1.04380	65,169	6,242	(1,797)	(10,177)	(33,222)	26,214	26,214
2006	46	5.31	1.04182	67,894	6,503	(1,873)	(10,603)	(34,611)	27,310	27,310
2007	47	6.31	1.03984	70,599	6,762	(1,947)	(11,025)	(35,990)	28,398	28,398
2008	48	7.31	1.03786	73,272	7,018	(2,021)	(11,443)	(37,353)	29,473	29,473
2009	49	8.31	1.03588	75,901	7,269	(2,093)	(11,853)	(38,693)	30,530	30,530
2010	50	9.31	1.03391	78,475	7,516	(2,164)	(12,255)	(40,005)	31,566	31,566
2011	51	10.31	1.03194	80,981	7,756	(2,234)	(12,647)	(41,283)	32,574	32,574
2012	52	11.31	1.03000	83,411	7,989	(2,301)	(13,026)	(42,521)	33,551	33,551
2013	53	12.31	1.03000	85,913	8,228	(2,370)	(13,417)	(43,797)	34,558	34,558
2014	54	13.31	1.03000	88,490	8,475	(2,441)	(13,820)	(45,111)	35,595	35,595
2015	55	14.31	1.03000	91,145	8,730	(2,514)	(14,234)	(46,464)	36,662	36,662
2016	56	15.31	1.03000	93,879	8,991	(2,589)	(14,661)	(47,858)	37,762	37,762
2017	57	16.31	1.03000	96,696	9,261	(2,667)	(15,101)	(49,294)	38,895	38,895
2018	58	17.31	1.03000	99,597	9,539	(2,747)	(15,554)	(50,773)	40,062	40,062
2019	59	18.31	1.03000	102,585	9,825	(2,829)	(16,021)	(52,296)	41,264	41,264
2020	60	19.31	1.03000	105,662	10,120	(2,914)	(16,501)	(53,865)	42,502	41,633
2021	61	19.64	1.03000	36,276	3,474	(1,001)	(5,665)	(18,493)	14,592	13,933
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$1,591,700</b>	<b>\$152,447</b>	<b>(\$43,441)</b>	<b>(\$248,656)</b>	<b>(\$740,796)</b>	<b>\$711,253</b>	<b>\$709,725</b>



Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	16.100%	62.640%	3.838%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MRS. ALVA CYNTHIA SANCHEZ**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PROJECTED PENSION	VESTED PENSION	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	41	0.31	\$620	\$0	\$0	(\$113)	\$507	\$507
2002	42	1.31	2,121	0	0	(387)	1,734	1,734
2003	43	2.31	2,223	0	0	(406)	1,817	1,817
2004	44	3.31	2,325	0	0	(424)	1,900	1,900
2005	45	4.31	2,426	0	0	(1,520)	907	907
2006	46	5.31	2,528	0	0	(1,583)	944	944
2007	47	6.31	2,629	0	0	(1,647)	982	982
2008	48	7.31	2,728	0	0	(1,709)	1,019	1,019
2009	49	8.31	2,826	0	0	(1,770)	1,056	1,056
2010	50	9.31	2,922	0	0	(1,830)	1,092	1,092
2011	51	10.31	3,015	0	0	(1,889)	1,126	1,126
2012	52	11.31	3,106	0	0	(1,945)	1,160	1,160
2013	53	12.31	3,199	0	0	(2,004)	1,195	1,195
2014	54	13.31	3,295	0	0	(2,064)	1,231	1,231
2015	55	14.31	3,394	0	0	(2,126)	1,268	1,268
2016	56	15.31	3,495	0	0	(2,189)	1,306	1,306
2017	57	16.31	3,600	0	0	(2,255)	1,345	1,345
2018	58	17.31	3,708	0	0	(2,323)	1,385	1,385
2019	59	18.31	3,819	0	0	(2,393)	1,427	1,427
2020	60	19.31	3,934	0	0	(2,464)	1,470	1,440
2021	61	20.31	1,351	0	0	(846)	505	476
2022	62	21.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2023	63	22.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2024	64	23.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2025	65	24.31	25,968	(4,328)	(3,484)	(11,373)	6,783	5,488
2026	66	25.31	38,952	(6,492)	(5,226)	(17,059)	10,175	7,922
2027	67	26.31	38,952	(6,492)	(5,226)	(17,059)	10,175	7,625
2028	68	27.31	38,952	(6,492)	(5,226)	(17,059)	10,175	7,339
2029	69	28.31	38,952	(6,492)	(5,226)	(17,059)	10,175	7,063
2030	70	29.31	38,952	(6,492)	(5,226)	(17,059)	10,175	6,798
2031	71	30.31	38,952	(6,492)	(5,226)	(17,059)	10,175	6,543
2032	72	31.31	38,952	(6,492)	(5,226)	(17,059)	10,175	6,297
2033	73	32.31	38,952	(6,492)	(5,226)	(17,059)	10,175	6,061
2034	74	33.31	38,952	(6,492)	(5,226)	(17,059)	10,175	5,833
2035	75	34.31	38,952	(6,492)	(5,226)	(17,059)	10,175	5,614
2036	76	35.31	38,952	(6,492)	(5,226)	(17,059)	10,175	5,404
2037	77	36.31	38,952	(6,492)	(5,226)	(17,059)	10,175	5,201
2038	78	37.31	38,952	(6,492)	(5,226)	(17,059)	10,175	5,006
2039	79	37.56	9,738	(1,623)	(1,307)	(4,265)	2,544	1,222
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$601,345</b>	<b>(\$90,347)</b>	<b>(\$72,729)</b>	<b>(\$271,297)</b>	<b>\$166,972</b>	<b>\$114,732</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MRS. ALVA CYNTHIA SANCHEZ**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	41	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	42	1.31			0	0
2003	43	2.31			0	0
2004	44	3.31			0	0
2005	45	4.31			0	0
2006	46	5.31			0	0
2007	47	6.31			0	0
2008	48	7.31			0	0
2009	49	8.31			0	0
2010	50	9.31			0	0
2011	51	10.31			0	0
2012	52	11.31			0	0
2013	53	12.31			0	0
2014	54	13.31			0	0
2015	55	14.31			0	0
2016	56	15.31			0	0
2017	57	16.31			0	0
2018	58	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-23**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Ms. Julie Marie Geis**

December 11, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **June 1, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**Ms. JULIE MARIE GEIS**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$4,160,608
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	220,743
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	148,476
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$4,529,827</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
200,991	3.0%	25.800%	10,527	13.676%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MS. JULIE MARIE GEIS**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	44	0.31	1.00000	\$61,632	\$3,228	\$0	(\$15,901)	(\$6,254)	\$42,705	\$42,705
2002	45	1.31	1.04380	209,796	10,988	(4,915)	(52,503)	(20,650)	142,716	142,716
2003	46	2.31	1.04182	218,569	11,448	(5,120)	(54,699)	(21,514)	148,684	148,684
2004	47	3.31	1.03984	227,276	11,904	(5,324)	(56,878)	(22,371)	154,607	154,607
2005	48	4.31	1.03786	235,879	12,354	(5,526)	(59,031)	(23,217)	160,459	160,459
2006	49	5.31	1.03588	244,343	12,798	(5,724)	(61,149)	(24,050)	166,217	166,217
2007	50	6.31	1.03391	252,629	13,232	(5,918)	(63,223)	(24,866)	171,853	171,853
2008	51	7.31	1.03194	260,698	13,654	(6,107)	(65,242)	(25,660)	177,343	177,343
2009	52	8.31	1.03000	268,519	14,064	(6,290)	(67,200)	(26,430)	182,663	182,663
2010	53	9.31	1.03000	276,575	14,486	(6,479)	(69,216)	(27,223)	188,143	188,143
2011	54	10.31	1.03000	284,872	14,920	(6,673)	(71,292)	(28,040)	193,787	193,787
2012	55	11.31	1.03000	293,418	15,368	(6,874)	(73,431)	(28,881)	199,601	199,601
2013	56	12.31	1.03000	302,221	15,829	(7,080)	(75,634)	(29,747)	205,589	205,589
2014	57	13.31	1.03000	311,288	16,304	(7,292)	(77,903)	(30,640)	211,757	211,757
2015	58	14.31	1.03000	320,626	16,793	(7,511)	(80,240)	(31,559)	218,109	218,109
2016	59	15.31	1.03000	330,245	17,297	(7,736)	(82,647)	(32,506)	224,653	224,653
2017	60	16.31	1.03000	340,152	17,816	(7,968)	(85,127)	(33,481)	231,392	231,392
2018	61	17.31	1.03000	350,357	18,350	(8,207)	(87,680)	(34,485)	238,334	238,334
2019	62	18.31	1.03000	360,868	18,901	(8,454)	(90,311)	(35,520)	245,484	245,484
2020	63	19.31	1.03000	371,694	19,468	(8,707)	(93,020)	(36,586)	252,848	247,678
2021	64	20.31	1.03000	382,845	20,052	(8,968)	(95,811)	(37,683)	260,434	245,532
2022	65	20.97	1.03000	262,887	13,769	(6,158)	(65,790)	(25,876)	178,831	163,303
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$6,167,389</b>	<b>\$323,019</b>	<b>(\$143,033)</b>	<b>(\$1,543,928)</b>	<b>(\$607,239)</b>	<b>\$4,196,209</b>	<b>\$4,160,608</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	13.676%	4.330%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MS. JULIE MARIE GEIS**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401 (K)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	44	0.31	\$2,669	\$0	\$0	(\$365)	\$2,304	\$2,304
2002	45	1.31	8,161	0	0	(1,116)	7,045	7,045
2003	46	2.31	8,637	0	0	(1,181)	7,456	7,456
2004	47	3.31	9,545	0	0	(1,305)	8,240	8,240
2005	48	4.31	9,907	0	0	(1,355)	8,552	8,552
2006	49	5.31	10,262	0	0	(1,403)	8,859	8,859
2007	50	6.31	10,610	0	0	(1,451)	9,159	9,159
2008	51	7.31	10,949	0	0	(1,497)	9,452	9,452
2009	52	8.31	11,278	0	0	(1,542)	9,735	9,735
2010	53	9.31	11,616	0	0	(1,589)	10,027	10,027
2011	54	10.31	11,964	0	0	(1,636)	10,328	10,328
2012	55	11.31	12,323	0	0	(1,685)	10,638	10,638
2013	56	12.31	12,693	0	0	(1,736)	10,957	10,957
2014	57	13.31	13,074	0	0	(1,788)	11,286	11,286
2015	58	14.31	13,466	0	0	(1,842)	11,624	11,624
2016	59	15.31	13,870	0	0	(1,897)	11,973	11,973
2017	60	16.31	14,286	0	0	(1,954)	12,332	12,332
2018	61	17.31	14,715	0	0	(2,012)	12,702	12,702
2019	62	18.31	15,156	0	0	(2,073)	13,083	13,083
2020	63	19.31	15,611	0	0	(2,135)	13,476	13,200
2021	64	20.31	16,079	0	0	(2,199)	13,880	13,086
2022	65	20.97	11,041	0	0	(1,510)	9,531	8,703
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$257,912</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$35,271)</b>	<b>\$222,641</b>	<b>\$220,743</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MS. JULIE MARIE GEIS**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	44	0.31	\$1,612	\$431	\$2,042	\$2,042
2002	45	1.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	6,660
2003	46	2.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	6,660
2004	47	3.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	6,660
2005	48	4.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	6,660
2006	49	5.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	6,660
2007	50	6.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	6,660
2008	51	7.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	6,660
2009	52	8.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	6,660
2010	53	9.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	6,660
2011	54	10.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	6,660
2012	55	11.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	6,660
2013	56	12.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	6,660
2014	57	13.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	6,660
2015	58	14.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	6,660
2016	59	15.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	6,660
2017	60	16.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	6,660
2018	61	17.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	6,660
2019	62	18.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	6,660
2020	63	19.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	6,494
2021	64	20.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	6,196
2022	65	21.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	5,912
2023	66	22.31	5,256	1,404	6,660	5,642
2024	67	22.73	2,225	594	2,820	2,310
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$119,469</b>	<b>\$31,913</b>	<b>\$151,382</b>	<b>\$148,476</b>



# **Exhibit B-24**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mrs. Carolyn Halmon**

December 11, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **May 6, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MRS. CAROLYN HALMON**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$833,693
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	(69,139)
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	437,793
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$1,202,347</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
66,332	3.0%	20.120%	2,400	9.123%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MRS. CAROLYN HALMON**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	49	0.31	1.00000	\$20,340	\$736	\$0	(\$4,092)	(\$1,482)	\$15,501	\$15,501
2002	50	1.31	1.03391	68,581	2,511	(1,704)	(13,385)	(4,848)	51,156	51,156
2003	51	2.31	1.03194	70,772	2,591	(1,758)	(13,812)	(5,003)	52,790	52,790
2004	52	3.31	1.03000	72,895	2,638	(1,810)	(14,226)	(5,153)	54,343	54,343
2005	53	4.31	1.03000	75,082	2,717	(1,864)	(14,653)	(5,308)	55,973	55,973
2006	54	5.31	1.03000	77,334	2,798	(1,920)	(15,093)	(5,467)	57,653	57,653
2007	55	6.31	1.03000	79,654	2,882	(1,978)	(15,546)	(5,631)	59,382	59,382
2008	56	7.31	1.03000	82,044	2,969	(2,037)	(16,012)	(5,800)	61,164	61,164
2009	57	8.31	1.03000	84,505	3,058	(2,098)	(16,492)	(5,974)	62,999	62,999
2010	58	9.31	1.03000	87,040	3,150	(2,161)	(16,987)	(6,153)	64,889	64,889
2011	59	10.31	1.03000	89,652	3,244	(2,226)	(17,497)	(6,338)	66,835	66,835
2012	60	11.31	1.03000	92,341	3,341	(2,293)	(18,022)	(6,528)	68,840	68,840
2013	61	12.31	1.03000	95,111	3,442	(2,362)	(18,562)	(6,724)	70,905	70,905
2014	62	13.31	1.03000	97,965	3,545	(2,433)	(19,119)	(6,925)	73,033	73,033
2015	63	13.56	1.03000	25,226	913	(626)	(4,923)	(2,358)	18,231	18,231
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$1,118,543</b>	<b>\$40,534</b>	<b>(\$27,271)</b>	<b>(\$218,422)</b>	<b>(\$79,691)</b>	<b>\$833,693</b>	<b>\$833,693</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	9.123%	-7.000%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MRS. CAROLYN HALMON**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION CONTRIBUTION	401(K)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	49	0.31	(\$1,424)	\$0	\$0	\$130	(\$1,294)	(\$1,294)
2002	50	1.31	(4,801)	0	0	438	(4,363)	(4,363)
2003	51	2.31	(4,805)	0	0	438	(4,367)	(4,367)
2004	52	3.31	(4,950)	0	0	452	(4,498)	(4,498)
2005	53	4.31	(5,098)	0	0	465	(4,633)	(4,633)
2006	54	5.31	(5,251)	0	0	479	(4,772)	(4,772)
2007	55	6.31	(5,409)	0	0	493	(4,915)	(4,915)
2008	56	7.31	(5,571)	0	0	508	(5,063)	(5,063)
2009	57	8.31	(5,738)	0	0	523	(5,214)	(5,214)
2010	58	9.31	(5,910)	0	0	539	(5,371)	(5,371)
2011	59	10.31	(6,087)	0	0	555	(5,532)	(5,532)
2012	60	11.31	(6,270)	0	0	572	(5,698)	(5,698)
2013	61	12.31	(6,458)	0	0	589	(5,869)	(5,869)
2014	62	13.31	(6,652)	0	0	607	(6,045)	(6,045)
2015	63	13.56	(1,713)	0	0	207	(1,506)	(1,506)
<b>Total</b>			<b>(\$76,136)</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$6,997</b>	<b>(\$69,139)</b>	<b>(\$69,139)</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MRS. CAROLYN HALMON**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	49	0.31	\$4,011	\$2,870	\$6,881	\$6,881
2002	50	1.31	13,080	9,360	22,440	22,440
2003	51	2.31	13,080	9,360	22,440	22,440
2004	52	3.31	13,080	9,360	22,440	22,440
2005	53	4.31	13,080	9,360	22,440	22,440
2006	54	5.31	13,080	9,360	22,440	22,440
2007	55	6.31	13,080	9,360	22,440	22,440
2008	56	7.31	13,080	3,223	16,303	16,303
2009	57	8.31	13,080	2,316	15,396	15,396
2010	58	9.31	13,080	2,316	15,396	15,396
2011	59	10.31	13,080	2,316	15,396	15,396
2012	60	11.31	13,080	2,316	15,396	15,396
2013	61	12.31	13,080	2,316	15,396	15,396
2014	62	13.31	13,080	2,316	15,396	15,396
2015	63	14.31	13,080	2,316	15,396	15,396
2016	64	15.31	13,080	2,316	15,396	15,396
2017	65	16.31	13,080	2,316	15,396	15,396
2018	66	17.31	13,080	2,316	15,396	15,396
2019	67	18.31	13,080	2,316	15,396	15,396
2020	68	19.31	13,080	2,316	15,396	15,081
2021	69	20.31	13,080	2,316	15,396	14,515
2022	70	21.31	13,080	2,316	15,396	13,970
2023	71	22.31	13,080	2,316	15,396	13,446
2024	72	23.31	13,080	2,316	15,396	12,941
2025	73	24.31	13,080	2,316	15,396	12,455
2026	74	25.31	13,080	2,316	15,396	11,988
2027	75	26.31	13,080	2,316	15,396	11,538
2028	76	26.72	5,450	965	6,415	4,679
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$349,541</b>	<b>\$107,222</b>	<b>\$456,763</b>	<b>\$437,793</b>

# **Exhibit B-25**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Thomas J. Farino**

December 10, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **May 26, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile



VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MR. THOMAS J. FARINO**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$4,932,112
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	1,039,089
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	482,868
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$6,454,069</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
131,049	3.0%	17.132%	7,634	12.486%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. THOMAS J. FARINO**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	37	0.31	1.00000	\$40,185	\$2,341	\$0	(\$6,884)	(\$2,224)	\$33,417	\$33,417
2002	38	1.31	1.05781	138,626	8,076	(3,647)	(23,036)	(7,444)	112,575	112,575
2003	39	2.31	1.05580	146,362	8,526	(3,851)	(24,322)	(7,859)	118,857	118,857
2004	40	3.31	1.05379	154,235	8,985	(4,058)	(25,630)	(8,282)	125,250	125,250
2005	41	4.31	1.05179	162,222	9,450	(4,268)	(26,957)	(8,711)	131,737	131,737
2006	42	5.31	1.04979	170,299	9,921	(4,480)	(28,299)	(9,144)	138,295	138,295
2007	43	6.31	1.04779	178,437	10,395	(4,694)	(29,652)	(9,581)	144,904	144,904
2008	44	7.31	1.04579	186,608	10,871	(4,909)	(31,010)	(10,020)	151,540	151,540
2009	45	8.31	1.04380	194,782	11,347	(5,124)	(32,368)	(10,459)	158,178	158,178
2010	46	9.31	1.04182	202,928	11,822	(5,339)	(33,722)	(10,896)	164,793	164,793
2011	47	10.31	1.03984	211,011	12,293	(5,551)	(35,065)	(14,762)	167,926	167,926
2012	48	11.31	1.03786	219,000	12,758	(5,762)	(36,392)	(15,321)	174,283	174,283
2013	49	12.31	1.03588	226,858	13,216	(5,968)	(37,698)	(15,870)	180,536	180,536
2014	50	13.31	1.03391	234,550	13,664	(6,171)	(38,977)	(16,408)	186,659	186,659
2015	51	14.31	1.03194	242,043	14,100	(6,368)	(40,222)	(24,294)	185,260	185,260
2016	52	15.31	1.03000	249,304	14,523	(6,559)	(41,428)	(25,022)	190,818	190,818
2017	53	16.31	1.03000	256,783	14,959	(6,756)	(42,671)	(25,773)	196,542	196,542
2018	54	17.31	1.03000	264,486	15,408	(6,958)	(43,951)	(26,546)	202,438	202,438
2019	55	18.31	1.03000	272,421	15,870	(7,167)	(45,270)	(27,343)	208,512	208,512
2020	56	19.31	1.03000	280,594	16,346	(7,382)	(46,628)	(28,163)	214,767	210,375
2021	57	20.31	1.03000	289,011	16,837	(7,604)	(48,027)	(29,008)	221,210	208,552
2022	58	21.31	1.03000	297,682	17,342	(7,832)	(49,467)	(29,878)	227,846	206,746
2023	59	22.31	1.03000	306,612	17,862	(8,067)	(50,951)	(30,774)	234,682	204,955
2024	60	23.31	1.03000	315,811	18,398	(8,309)	(52,480)	(31,698)	241,722	203,180
2025	61	24.31	1.03000	325,285	18,950	(8,558)	(54,054)	(32,649)	248,974	201,420
2026	62	25.31	1.03000	335,043	19,518	(8,815)	(55,676)	(33,628)	256,443	199,675
2027	63	26.31	1.03000	345,095	20,104	(9,079)	(57,346)	(34,637)	264,136	197,945
2028	64	27.31	1.03000	355,448	20,707	(9,351)	(59,067)	(35,676)	272,060	196,231
2029	65	27.97	1.03000	244,078	14,219	(6,421)	(40,560)	(24,498)	186,818	130,514
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$6,845,797</b>	<b>\$398,806</b>	<b>(\$179,048)</b>	<b>(\$1,137,811)</b>	<b>(\$586,568)</b>	<b>\$5,341,176</b>	<b>\$4,932,112</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	17.132%	12.486%	4.000%	0.000%

## EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS

MR. THOMAS J. FARINO

SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION CONTRIBUTION	VESTED PENSION	PROJECTED PENSION	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	37	0.31	(\$1,065)			\$182	\$110	(\$772)	(\$772)
2002	38	1.31	(3,674)			629	380	(2,664)	(2,664)
2003	39	2.31	(3,762)			645	389	(2,728)	(2,728)
2004	40	3.31	(3,965)			679	410	(2,875)	(2,875)
2005	41	4.31	(348)	(48,302)		8,334	5,034	(35,281)	(35,281)
2006	42	5.31	0	(52,693)		9,027	5,452	(38,214)	(38,214)
2007	43	6.31	0	(52,693)		9,027	5,452	(38,214)	(38,214)
2008	44	7.31	0	(52,693)		9,027	5,452	(38,214)	(38,214)
2009	45	8.31	0	(52,693)		9,027	5,452	(38,214)	(38,214)
2010	46	9.31	7,874	(52,693)	103,335	(10,025)	(6,055)	42,436	42,436
2011	47	10.31	8,187	(52,693)	112,729	(11,688)	(7,059)	49,476	49,476
2012	48	11.31	8,497	(52,693)	112,729	(11,741)	(7,091)	49,701	49,701
2013	49	12.31	8,802	(52,693)	112,729	(11,793)	(7,123)	49,922	49,922
2014	50	13.31	9,101	(52,693)	112,729	(11,844)	(7,154)	50,139	50,139
2015	51	14.31	9,391	(52,693)	112,729	(11,894)	(7,184)	50,349	50,349
2016	52	15.31	9,673	(52,693)	112,729	(11,942)	(7,213)	50,554	50,554
2017	53	16.31	9,963	(52,693)	112,729	(11,992)	(7,243)	50,764	50,764
2018	54	17.31	10,262	(52,693)	112,729	(12,043)	(7,274)	50,981	50,981
2019	55	18.31	10,570	(52,873)	112,729	(12,065)	(7,287)	51,074	51,074
2020	56	19.31	10,887	(53,053)	112,909	(12,119)	(7,320)	51,304	50,254
2021	57	20.31	11,214	(53,233)	113,089	(12,175)	(7,354)	51,541	48,591
2022	58	21.31	11,550	(53,413)	113,269	(12,233)	(7,389)	51,784	46,989
2023	59	22.31	11,897	(53,593)	113,449	(12,292)	(7,424)	52,036	45,445
2024	60	23.31	12,253	(53,773)	113,629	(12,353)	(7,461)	52,295	43,956
2025	61	24.31	12,621	(53,953)	113,809	(12,416)	(7,499)	52,561	42,522
2026	62	25.31	13,000	(54,133)	113,989	(12,481)	(7,539)	52,836	41,140
2027	63	26.31	13,390	(54,313)	114,169	(12,548)	(7,579)	53,119	39,807
2028	64	27.31	13,791	(54,493)	114,349	(12,617)	(7,621)	53,410	38,523
2029	65	28.31	9,470	(54,673)	114,529	(11,877)	(7,173)	50,276	34,902
2030	66	29.31		(54,853)	114,709	(10,254)	(6,194)	43,408	29,003
2031	67	30.31		(55,033)	114,889	(10,254)	(6,194)	43,408	27,914
2032	68	31.31		(55,213)	115,069	(10,254)	(6,194)	43,408	26,867
2033	69	32.31		(55,393)	115,249	(10,254)	(6,194)	43,408	25,858
2034	70	33.31		(55,573)	115,429	(10,254)	(6,194)	43,408	24,887
2035	71	34.31		(55,753)	115,609	(10,254)	(6,194)	43,408	23,953
2036	72	35.31		(55,933)	115,789	(10,254)	(6,194)	43,408	23,054
2037	73	36.31		(56,113)	115,969	(10,254)	(6,194)	43,408	22,189
2038	74	37.31		(56,293)	116,149	(10,254)	(6,194)	43,408	21,356
2039	75	38.31		(56,473)	116,329	(10,254)	(6,194)	43,408	20,554
2040	76	39.31		(56,653)	116,509	(10,254)	(6,194)	43,408	19,783
2041	77	40.31		(56,833)	116,689	(10,254)	(6,194)	43,408	19,040
2042	78	41.31		(57,013)	116,869	(10,254)	(6,194)	43,408	18,326
2043	79	41.64		(19,064)	39,016	(3,418)	(2,065)	14,469	5,954
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$199,580</b>	<b>(\$2,071,007)</b>	<b>\$3,799,359</b>	<b>(\$330,284)</b>	<b>(\$199,490)</b>	<b>\$1,398,158</b>	<b>\$1,039,089</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MR. THOMAS J. FARINO**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	CARE FOR DAUGHTER	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	37	0.31	\$5,339	\$5,932	\$1,350	\$12,621	\$12,621
2002	38	1.31	17,412	19,344	4,404	41,160	41,160
2003	39	2.31	17,412	19,344	4,404	41,160	41,160
2004	40	3.31	17,412	19,344	4,404	41,160	41,160
2005	41	4.31	17,412	19,344	4,404	41,160	41,160
2006	42	5.31	17,412	19,344	4,404	41,160	41,160
2007	43	6.31	17,412	19,344	4,404	41,160	41,160
2008	44	7.31	17,412	19,344	4,404	41,160	41,160
2009	45	8.31	17,412	19,344	4,404	41,160	41,160
2010	46	9.31	16,461	17,315	4,404	38,180	38,180
2011	47	10.31	14,916	14,016	4,404	33,336	33,336
2012	48	11.31	14,916	14,016	4,404	33,336	33,336
2013	49	12.31	14,916	14,016	4,404	33,336	33,336
2014	50	12.39	1,243	1,168	367	2,778	2,778
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$207,088</b>	<b>\$221,215</b>	<b>\$54,565</b>	<b>\$482,868</b>	<b>\$482,868</b>